
| RESEARCH ARTICLE

A Phenomenological Analysis of Top-Down Policy Implementation in the Religious Service Sector in Bondowoso, Indonesia

Hijrah Saputra¹ ✉ Abubakar Eby Hara², Himawan Bayu Patriadi³ and Hanif Nurcholis⁴

¹*Doctoral Student, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, University of Jember*

²³*Department of International Relations, University of Jember*

⁴*Faculty of Law, Social and Political Sciences, Open University Indonesia*

Corresponding Author: Hijrah Saputra, **E-mail:** 200930101001@mail.unej.ac.id

| ABSTRACT

The One-Stop Integrated Service (Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu, PTSP) represents a public service reform in Indonesia aimed at enhancing efficiency and accessibility. This study analyzes the implementation of PTSP in Bondowoso using a qualitative phenomenological approach to understand the experiences of street-level bureaucrats (SLBs) and supervisors in executing top-down policies. In-depth interviews reveal key challenges, including misalignment between central policies and local needs, coordination issues, resource limitations, and the emotional pressure faced by SLBs. The findings indicate that the separation of front-office and back-office functions, along with reliance on electronic signatures, slows down service delivery. SLBs experience pressure to meet public expectations while adhering to institutional regulations. This study recommends developing adaptive governance, integrating technologies such as e-letters, and providing training for SLBs to enhance their capacity. These findings contribute to a deeper understanding of top-down policy implementation and offer solutions to improve public service quality, particularly in the religious service sector.

| KEYWORDS

Top-Down Governance, One-Stop Integrated Service (PTSP), Street-Level Bureaucrats (SLBs), Policy Implementation, Phenomenology.

| ARTICLE INFORMATION

ACCEPTED: 01 May 2025

PUBLISHED: 30 May 2025

DOI: 10.32996/jhsss.2025.7.5.7

1. Introduction

Many countries, particularly in Asia, Africa, and Latin America, have adopted decentralized governance systems as a core strategy to improve efficiency and inclusivity in public service delivery. Yet this system struggles to cater each national policy to the unique local context (Muthien, 2020; Ghuman and Singh, 2013; Rees and Hossain, 2013; Naim, 1998).

This top-down approach preserves national consistency but is often blind to local socio-economic and cultural dynamics (Wang et al., 2022). Therefore, better adaptation mechanisms are needed to ensure that national policies are more relevant and effective in local contexts (Zagorodny et al., 2023). Experiences from India and Nigeria demonstrate that cultural and religious diversity necessitates adjustments to national policies to ensure their effective implementation (Ikpe, 2004). The failure to integrate national policies with local conditions often leads to service disparities and erodes public trust in the government (Narain, 1976; Ordonez-Ponce, 2023).

Indonesia, as a country with high cultural and religious diversity, faces similar challenges. Public service reform is a key factor in ensuring fair access to essential services amid this diversity (Batley, 2004; Cohen, 1993). One of the initiatives aimed at addressing this reform is the establishment of the One-Stop Integrated Service (PTSP) as outlined in Law No. 25 of 2009 on

Public Services. This policy is designed to streamline administrative procedures and improve service delivery efficiency (Da Graca et al., 2020; Tian et al., 2009).

However, the implementation of PTSP across various regions has not always met expectations. In practice, this policy faces significant gaps between its national design and local needs, particularly in areas with high cultural and religious complexity. These gaps serve as a central focus of this study, which seeks to understand the barriers and challenges in implementing PTSP at the local level.

The implementation of One-Stop Integrated Services (PTSP) in Indonesia has faced criticism due to the gap between nationally mandated procedural standards and local community needs (MacCallum, 2008). While the system formally adheres to national administrative standards, its rigid focus on procedural compliance often neglects local contexts. For instance, strict electronic documentation requirements can become a barrier for communities in remote areas rather than accelerating service delivery. This reflects a significant mismatch between centrally designed policies and on-the-ground realities.

A study by Horridge and Wittwer (2017) highlights that top-down policies tend to be less adaptive to local needs, particularly in regions with limited infrastructure. In Bondowoso, for example, PTSP policies often fail to meet public expectations due to the lack of flexibility in service procedures, especially in the religious service sector. This phenomenon underscores the importance of adaptive governance in bridging the gap between central policies and local community needs.

To address these challenges, lessons from global practices can serve as a foundation for strengthening PTSP policies in Indonesia. In India, the involvement of local communities in consultation and policy decision-making has proven effective in ensuring the relevance of national policies to diverse local needs (Horridge and Wittwer, 2017). Meanwhile, in Nigeria, empowering frontline workers through intensive training and increased autonomy in decision-making has significantly improved public service quality and citizen satisfaction (Ikpe, 2004; M. Lipsky, 1981).

By integrating a participatory approach similar to India's and frontline worker empowerment as seen in Nigeria, Indonesia can develop a PTSP model that is more adaptive to local needs without compromising national policy uniformity. The case of Bondowoso serves as a tangible illustration of the challenges in PTSP implementation, particularly when best practices from other regions are applied without considering the unique social, economic, and cultural characteristics of local communities.

The implementation of the One-Stop Integrated Service (PTSP) in the religious service sector in Bondowoso reflects broader issues associated with the top-down policy approach. Lipsky (1981) highlights that top-down governance often creates tensions between central policies and local implementation. Similarly, the study by Horridge and Wittwer (2017) found comparable challenges in India, where national policies struggled to be effectively applied in regions with strong cultural characteristics. Therefore, PTSP reform in Indonesia requires a more flexible and responsive policy model that can better accommodate local dynamics, ensuring that public services are more effective and inclusive.

Policies formulated at the national level often fail to align with local realities. In Bondowoso, for example, limited human resources and technological infrastructure have created gaps in the implementation of PTSP, particularly in meeting the public demand for religious services. While PTSP was designed to streamline administrative processes, it often becomes trapped in the very bureaucratic inefficiencies it aims to reform. MacCallum (2008) notes that rigid bureaucratic structures frequently hinder administrative reforms, including those within the PTSP framework.

These challenges emphasize the need for adaptive governance that bridges the gap between national policies and local service needs. As demonstrated in India, community involvement in policy consultation and implementation (Horridge and Wittwer, 2017) has been an effective strategy to ensure policies remain relevant in diverse socio-cultural settings. In Bondowoso, PTSP implementation faces delays in student transfer letter processing due to weak coordination between front-office and back-office operations, as well as over-reliance on electronic signatures, which often becomes an obstacle in regions with limited digital infrastructure. This underscores the fact that centrally designed policies frequently overlook infrastructure limitations and administrative coordination challenges at the local level.

While PTSP reforms aim to improve access to essential services, in practice, these initiatives do not always effectively address the challenges faced by the public. Effective policies require local adaptation to function optimally. The case of Bondowoso highlights the importance of flexibility in policy implementation, ensuring that policies not only meet administrative requirements but also foster a sense of equity and inclusivity within the community.

Lessons from Bondowoso also hold global relevance, as many other countries—such as India and Nigeria—struggle with the same issue of aligning national policies with local needs. Several proven strategies that have successfully enhanced public service efficiency include:

1. Digital administration systems, as implemented in Estonia, to improve efficiency and accessibility.
2. Intensive training programs for street-level bureaucrats, as practiced in Nigeria (Ikpe, 2004), to enhance their capacity and autonomy.
3. Community engagement in policy implementation, as successfully applied in India (Horridge and Wittwer, 2017), to ensure local relevance.

In a multicultural society like Indonesia, integrating these strategies is crucial to ensuring that public services go beyond mere administrative compliance and are instead responsive to the diverse social and cultural needs of the population.

This paper argues that the core discussion surrounding the implementation of One-Stop Integrated Services (PTSP) lies in the role of Street-Level Bureaucrats (SLBs), who serve as the primary interface between the public and policy execution. As highlighted by Michael Lipsky (1981), SLBs hold a strategic position, as their decisions and actions directly determine how policies are translated into practice. In the context of Bondowoso, SLBs are responsible for translating the abstract principles of PTSP into tangible public services. However, this task is often highly complex due to limited institutional support, including restricted access to technology and specialized training, unclear procedural guidelines, and resource constraints in terms of both human capital and finances.

This study explores how these frontline workers navigate dual pressures: on the one hand, complying with hierarchical mandates from the central government, such as strict performance indicators, and on the other, addressing the needs of service recipients, which often require flexibility and adaptation. The discretionary practices employed by SLBs serve as a coping mechanism in response to field challenges but, at the same time, expose systemic weaknesses in policy design—particularly the misalignment between national policy objectives and local needs (Brodin, 2011; Michael Lipsky, 1981).

This paper analyzes the challenges of implementing top-down policies in public service reform, focusing on the One-Stop Integrated Service (Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu, PTSP) in Bondowoso. The discussion begins by exploring the historical context and international significance of public service transformation, emphasizing the top-down approach in decentralized governance systems while addressing the complexities of aligning national policies with cultural diversity, particularly in Indonesia. The analysis then shifts to policy implementation in Indonesia, with a focus on the religious service sector in Bondowoso, selected due to its unique challenges, such as resource constraints and cultural diversity, which highlight the gap between national policy design and local realities. The study further examines key obstacles in PTSP implementation, including logistical, procedural, and cultural barriers, underscoring how rigid national policies often fail to accommodate the flexibility required in local practices. Finally, the paper reflects on how adaptive governance can bridge the gap between central policies and local implementation, proposing recommendations such as increasing local community involvement in policymaking, empowering street-level bureaucrats with greater decision-making autonomy, and integrating technology to enhance public service efficiency and relevance. By adopting this approach, public services can be designed to be not only administratively effective but also more responsive to the needs of society.

2. Literature Review

2.1 Top-Down Governance in Policy Implementation

The top-down governance approach often encounters challenges in aligning national policies with local needs. This model is designed to ensure policy consistency at the national level but is frequently rigid in responding to local variations (Carey et al., 2015). As stated by a local government leader in Bondowoso, *"The policy has been implemented, but there needs to be regulatory adjustments at the regional level. Limitations in access and facilities should be considered."* This statement underscores the necessity of adapting policies to local contexts, particularly regarding infrastructure limitations and cultural characteristics, which are crucial for successful implementation.

The top-down approach focuses on policy formulation at higher levels of government, with lower administrative levels responsible for implementation (Carey et al., 2015). Sabatier and Mazmanian (1980) argue that this approach can be effective if policies are clearly designed, adequate resources are allocated, and robust oversight mechanisms are in place. However, the rigidity inherent in top-down governance often makes it less effective, particularly in contexts requiring local adaptation (Cosens et al., 2017). The Bondowoso experience demonstrates that without flexibility in policy execution, barriers such as limited administrative coordination and dependence on centralized procedures can hinder policy effectiveness.

The implementation of One-Stop Integrated Services (PTSP) in Bondowoso exemplifies these limitations. Centrally designed policies frequently fail to accommodate socio-economic and cultural distinctiveness at the local level. For example, disparities in administrative capacity and resource availability in Bondowoso have led to a significant gap between policy design and community needs. These limitations highlight the need for a more inclusive and participatory approach to public policy implementation. By involving local governments and stakeholders, policies can be adjusted to better reflect specific community needs. This approach not only enhances policy effectiveness but also strengthens public perception of ownership and accountability over institutionalized programs. However, the rigidity of top-down governance often renders it unsuitable for contexts that demand local adaptation (Cosens et al., 2017).

Amid the persistent challenges that hinder top-down approaches, a critical aspect requiring significant attention is the influence of those executing bureaucratic functions at the grassroots level, commonly referred to as Street-Level Bureaucrats (SLBs). SLBs are not merely responsible for implementing central programs but also possess a deep understanding of the on-the-ground obstacles to policy execution. As Michael Lipsky (1981) argues, SLBs provide a crucial framework for understanding how frontline workers shape policy outcomes through direct interactions with the public. Serving as intermediaries between the state and its citizens, SLBs exercise discretion to navigate the complexities of real-world governance (Brodin, 2011). However, this discretionary power often places them under conflicting pressures. In Bondowoso, for instance, SLBs face dual expectations: meeting public demands while adhering to institutional mandates. This dynamic highlights the importance of equipping frontline workers with adequate resources and training to effectively balance competing demands. Beyond understanding the PTSP program from a central policy perspective, attention must also be directed toward field-level implementers, given their strategic role in bridging national policies with local needs.

The One-Stop Integrated Service (PTSP) initiative represents a public service reform aimed at streamlining bureaucratic processes and enhancing accessibility for citizens. Studies by Mayunita (2022) and Biswan and Wardani (2017) highlight the significant potential of PTSP in improving efficiency and transparency in public service delivery. However, the success of this integrated service model heavily depends on effective coordination among administrative units and the ability to adapt processes to local needs and characteristics.

In this context, it is also essential to examine the emotional demands faced by Street-Level Bureaucrats (SLBs) in policy implementation. Hochschild's (1985) concept of emotional labor describes the effort required to manage emotions in service-oriented roles. In Bondowoso, SLBs often experience public dissatisfaction, exacerbated by systemic inefficiencies. These interactions contribute to stress and burnout, as SLBs are frequently held accountable for delays that are beyond their control. Addressing emotional pressures and workload burdens is crucial not only for the well-being of frontline workers but also for improving the overall quality of public service delivery.

The relationship between citizens and public institutions is significantly influenced by perceptions of trust and accountability. Denhardt and Denhardt (2000) New Public Service framework emphasizes the need for citizen-centered governance, which prioritizes engagement and responsiveness. In Bondowoso, public dissatisfaction with PTSP services reflects broader challenges in building trust between the government and its constituents. Enhancing transparency and developing participatory governance mechanisms are essential steps toward restoring public confidence in public administration.

While existing literature provides valuable theoretical insights into policy implementation and integrated service delivery, empirical studies focusing on religious services in Indonesia remain limited. This research addresses this gap by exploring the firsthand experiences of SLBs in Bondowoso, offering a localized perspective on the challenges and opportunities in implementing PTSP within a culturally diverse context. By bridging theoretical frameworks with empirical findings, this study aims to contribute meaningfully to the discourse on public administration and policy reform.

3. Methodology

This study adopts a qualitative phenomenological approach to explore how street-level bureaucrats (SLBs) perceive and experience the implementation of the One-Stop Integrated Service (PTSP) in Bondowoso (Groenewald, 2004). Data were collected through in-depth semi-structured interviews with 15 participants, including front-office staff, back-office staff, supervisors, and policy implementers at the Ministry of Religious Affairs in Bondowoso Regency. To strengthen data validity, the study also utilized direct observations and document analysis as part of the triangulation process.

Thematic coding was employed to analyze the data, focusing on recurring patterns, inconsistencies, and emerging themes related to policy understanding, coordination barriers, and emotional pressures experienced by SLBs. Member-checking was conducted to ensure that the findings accurately reflected the participants' lived experiences.

4. Results

4.1 Discrepancies in Policy Understanding

The findings of this study reveal a significant misalignment between the nationally designed PTSP policy framework and its local implementation in Bondowoso. In addition to differences in perception between policymakers and frontline implementers, there are also deviations from formal PTSP procedures in practice. For instance, the collection of promotion decrees (SK Kenaikan Pangkat) and periodic salary increment letters (KGB) is often conducted directly within the relevant office divisions rather than through PTSP. This occurs because citizens perceive the process as faster when bypassing the formal administrative flow. A PTSP officer explained:

"We often see applicants collecting their promotion decrees directly from the staffing office without going through PTSP. They believe it is faster, even though it does not follow official procedures."

Similarly, the processing and submission of Operational Permits (IJOP) for educational institutions, including madrasahs and Islamic boarding schools (pondok pesantren), frequently occur directly within office divisions, bypassing PTSP. This informal practice is driven by a desire to avoid delays, particularly in urgent cases. Another PTSP officer stated:

"For IJOP applications, many applicants go directly to the relevant office division. This happens often because they want the process to be quicker, despite our efforts to provide information on the official procedures."

The above practices show the chasm between the formal policy stated by the government and its actual implementation. They also emphasize that PTSP processes have not optimally adjusted to what the public wants, especially for time-sensitive services. Consequently, citizens tend to resort to shortcuts at the expense of transparency and accountability within the public service system.

The study also exposes how procedural ambiguity and inconsistency further exacerbates these gaps. A PTSP officer interviewed on 5 July 2023 described a similar frustration over unclear procedural guidelines:

"We are often confused. The central regulations contain too many details, but they are not relevant to our local conditions. Sometimes, we have to make decisions on our own without clear guidance."

Additionally, this disparity is reflected in the different views of front- and back-office staff. Staff on the front lines whose jobs put them face to face with the public expressed their frustration at being held up by members of the back office. On July 4, 2023, in an interview, a PTSP officer saying:

"We are frequently faced with upset citizens, and we don't have answers. Sometimes we feel like we're just a punching bag for frustration."

A six-month observation period (January-July 2023) confirmed these delays are driven by poor communication and lack of operational cohesion. This not only reduces user experience but also SLB (street level bureaucrats) would not be able to do justice with their jobs. پنجاب, which only started in November, is now closely monitoring the performance of the public sector banks. One such SLB, a protector on July 6, 2023, described feeling "trapped" between systemic inefficiencies and public expectations:

"We frequently encounter dissatisfied citizens, yet we lack sufficient authority or clarity to provide immediate solutions. Sometimes, it feels like we are just an outlet for frustration."

In an attempt to navigate these challenges, some SLBs rely on temporary measures, such as offering ambiguous responses to pacify citizens during periods of delayed service. Then in the same interview, a PTSP officer explained:

"When there's no way out, we simply say something very simple just to reduce the situation for the citizens. But we know it's only a stopgap."

Based on the interviews, one familiar problem was identified: communication among front-office and back-office personnel is not working well. "A PTSP officer interviewed on July 6, 2023 said,

"Communication between the front office and back office is terrible. We don't even know at times, the status of documents that are getting processed in the back office."

Unfortunately, coordination is further hampered by technology and infrastructure constraints, including legacy IT systems and limited facilities. One SLB described the technical difficulties that have become a routine part of their life in a July 6, 2023 interview:

"The computer system crashes frequently, so we have to do many documents manually. That really slows down our work a lot."

Over time, this has deteriorated due to high workload pressure and lack of systemic support not only on the PTSP officers but also management has not provided maximum support. This state of affairs certainly reinforces the need for systemic reforms, and those reforms should be built on the principles of responsiveness, transparency, and empowerment of SLBs operating in PTSP, as I will discuss below.

4.2 Solution-Oriented Approaches to PTSP Challenges

The observed informal practices of retrieving promotion decrees (SK) and processing Operational Permits (IJOP) outside the official PTSP workflow highlight the urgent need for systemic reforms to make PTSP more adaptive to local conditions. Findings from six months of interviews and observations (January–July 2023) indicate that the misalignment between top-down policies and local realities necessitates a more flexible, locally responsive reform approach.

One promising solution is to strengthen the technological infrastructure to enhance administrative efficiency and transparency. For example, implementing a real-time document tracking system would allow applicants to monitor their request status without needing to visit office divisions in person. Additionally, a more integrated electronic signature system could expedite administrative processes while reducing dependence on the physical presence of senior officials.

Another proposed solution involves establishing more flexible guidelines for urgent services. These guidelines should allow PTSP officers and relevant office divisions to handle specific cases without compromising transparency. For instance, promotion decrees (SK) and periodic salary increment letters (KGB) could be categorized under a special priority framework within PTSP, enabling expedited processing while maintaining formal procedural integrity.

The necessity of policy adaptation to local dynamics is also evident in efforts to replicate best practices from Batu City. While Batu City's PTSP model shares similar policy structures, Bondowoso faces significant limitations when attempting to implement the same approach. A PTSP officer interviewed on July 5, 2023, highlighted the challenges of resource constraints in adapting Batu's model:

"We found the model in Batu City to be very effective. However, here in Bondowoso, we face technological and infrastructure limitations that make implementation far less seamless."

Additionally, while electronic signatures are intended to streamline administrative procedures, their effectiveness remains heavily dependent on the availability of senior officials. A PTSP officer interviewed on July 6, 2023, explained:

"If the senior official is unavailable, even if all documents are complete, we still have to wait for their electronic signature, which can delay the process by several days."

These findings emphasize the need for localized policy modifications that account for technological constraints, human resource capacity, and procedural efficiency, ensuring that PTSP reforms are not only administratively sound but also practically feasible in diverse local settings.

As part of localized adaptations, one successful initiative that has been implemented is the use of WhatsApp autoresponders for religious service inquiries. This system allows citizens to access basic service information—such as procedures and document requirements—without visiting the PTSP office in person. Pre-set automated responses help PTSP officers provide instant replies regarding necessary documents, estimated processing times, and other service-related details. This innovation not only enhances efficiency but also reduces the workload of frontline officers. A PTSP officer interviewed on July 10, 2023, highlighted the benefits of this approach:

"With WhatsApp autoresponders, we can quickly answer simple inquiries without needing to engage in constant direct interactions. This has been extremely helpful, especially for religious services, where procedural clarity is often required."

In addition to technological integration, intensive training is essential for PTSP officers and street-level bureaucrats (SLBs), particularly in communication skills and situational management. Training programs can enhance their ability to explain procedures clearly and handle public complaints more professionally. A PTSP officer, interviewed on June 7, 2023, emphasized the importance of training:

"If we were given training tailored to real-world situations, it would be much easier for us to engage with the public and explain service processes effectively."

Beyond technological upgrades and training, a participatory approach is needed to reform PTSP policies effectively. Involving the community in policy redesign can increase public trust and reduce pressure on SLBs, who are often caught in the middle of public dissatisfaction and institutional mandates. A supervisor interviewed on July 5, 2023, stressed the importance of citizen involvement:

"Service integration is not just about technology or systems. It is also about how we engage the public to collectively understand processes and challenges."

A key step in enhancing service efficiency is to improve internal coordination between front-office and back-office staff. Observations indicate that poor internal communication is often the primary cause of service delays. Establishing more effective cross-unit communication mechanisms would help streamline service delivery and minimize public complaints.

By integrating technology-driven solutions, capacity-building initiatives, participatory governance, and improved internal coordination, PTSP reforms can become more responsive, efficient, and aligned with local needs, ultimately fostering better public service experiences and stronger institutional accountability.

This change is critical not only in increasing the efficiency of services, it is also needed to improve public confidence in the PTSP. With a more adaptive and locally oriented approach PTSP implementation in Bondowoso potentially become a more responsive and transparent model.

The highlight findings/ recommendations of the study emphasizes on cross-unit communication mechanism, use of modern technology to handle more administrative works as well as quick response teams to solve urgent cases. An improvement of the PTSP service will make it more effective and right on target with the local community. The results of the research show that in the process of implementing PTSP, it is necessary to accommodate local dynamics and improve the capacity of human resources. The answer lies in community engagement, street level bureaucrats (SLBs) empowerment and the undeniable role of relevant technology that can bridge the gap between central directives and local implementation. This will help PTSP to adapt and flexibility so the Organizational culture can be improved to meet the expectations of the public and in the end to improve the trust of the public service system.

5. Discussion

5.1 Policy Misalignment and Contextual Challenges

This study shows that the implementation of PTSP in Bondowoso faces various contextual challenges, especially the misalignment between top-down policies and local needs. In the religious service sector, policies that overlook local realities have led to a disconnect between community expectations and PTSP operations. For example, centrally determined service schedules often do not align with mosque operating hours, which serve as key administrative hubs in the local community.

The lack of community participation in policy formulation exacerbates these issues, leading to public dissatisfaction due to complex and non-transparent processes. Street-level bureaucrats (SLBs) often face a dilemma between adhering to strict procedures and addressing community needs that require flexible solutions. This creates emotional strain for SLBs, who feel unsupported by the system in implementing policies adaptively.

The phenomenological approach used in this study provides insights into the subjective experiences of SLBs but is limited in explaining broader structural factors, such as resource allocation and policy support from the central government. The policy misalignment observed aligns with Matland's (1995) ambiguity-conflict model, which emphasizes the need for local flexibility to address ambiguous policy challenges.

Another challenge is the lack of coordination between front-office and back-office operations, leading to service delays and a negative public perception of PTSP. This study highlights the importance of integrating local input into the formulation of public policies and proposes specialized training programs for SLBs in Bondowoso to reduce ambiguities in policy implementation. PTSP reform should include systemic support enhancement, local capacity building, and multi-stakeholder collaboration to address broader governance challenges.

5.2 Coordination and Technology Integration

These results are in accordance with Matland's (1995) ambiguity-conflict model and confirm that local flexibility can be determinant in the case of high-ambiguity and low-conflict policies. For PTSP in Bondowoso, top-down policy design has neglected the local condition, including limitation of technology and the socio-economic situation. This highlights the necessity to adapt to more responsive policies that better respond to the needs of local communities.

Also refers to the Street-Level Bureaucracy theory by Michael Lipsky (1981) which is essential to leadership theories describing the function of SLBs as intermediaries between policy and the public. SLBs constantly struggle with a dilemma—they need to comply with tight formal procedures, but at the same time, they are forced by the public demands for quick and adaptive solutions. Much communication happens over the phone without a proper coordinated system in place, which can put a strain on SLBs who are already overloaded, adding another layer to the emotional burden.

In addition, the New Public Service concept put forward by Denhardt and Denhardt (2000), relates to citizen engagement in the governance of public processes. This study found that the lack of public involvement in the planning and decision-making process has contributed to dissatisfaction with PTSP. Citizens not only expect efficiency in services, but also transparency and inclusiveness. To meet the challenges and improve the efficiency of PTSP, various innovations were implemented like:

1. One Day Service and Non-One Day Service

- One Day Service is applied to urgent services, such as issuing certificates or renewing administrative documents. The process is completed within a single working day, provided that all required documents are complete.
- Non-One Day Service is designated for more complex verification processes, such as operational permits or institutional establishment approvals. This system ensures gradual document processing while keeping applicants informed of their request progress.

2. WhatsApp Autoresponder System

- The use of WhatsApp autoresponders has significantly improved access to essential information, such as document requirements, estimated processing times, and application status.
- This innovation reduces the workload of front-office staff, who frequently answer repetitive inquiries, allowing them to focus on core service delivery tasks.

3. E-Correspondence via the SRIKANDI Program

- The SRIKANDI (Integrated Dynamic Archival Information System), launched under the Ministry of Communications and Informatics (Kominfo), has been introduced to enhance administrative document management.
- This program facilitates faster and more transparent correspondence, reducing dependency on physical documents and improving bureaucratic efficiency.

This study also highlights the need for governance reforms in PTSP that incorporate technology integration. For instance, the implementation of a real-time document tracking system would not only enhance efficiency but also improve transparency. Consequently, public trust in the system could be strengthened while simultaneously reducing the burden on SLBs, who often have to handle complaints directly.

5.3 International Implications

The findings from the implementation of One-Stop Integrated Services (PTSP) in Bondowoso offer valuable insights for countries facing similar challenges in enforcing public policies within multicultural and decentralized governance settings. One of the key implications is the need for more adaptive policy approaches that accommodate local needs within decentralized government systems. Nationally designed policies often fail to account for local dynamics, including variations in resource capacity and cultural complexities.

Countries with rich cultural diversity, such as India, Brazil, and South Africa, which also operate under decentralized governance structures, can adopt adaptive governance strategies to bridge the gap between national policymaking and local

implementation. Direct community engagement not only enhances policy relevance but also fosters a sense of public ownership, ultimately strengthening government legitimacy.

Global Innovations That Can Be Adapted

1. Integrated Digital Systems
 - Estonia has successfully implemented a unified digital service system, allowing citizens to access multiple government services through a single portal.
 - This model improves efficiency, transparency, and accessibility, reducing bureaucratic inefficiencies in public administration.
2. Active Public Dialogues
 - Canada has pioneered localized public dialogue programs to ensure that policies align with the needs of remote communities.
 - This approach fosters community participation, enabling tailored policy adjustments based on grassroots feedback.
3. Rapid Response Public Services
 - Brazil has deployed mobile administrative units that bring government services to remote areas via specialized vehicles equipped with modern communication technology.
 - This initiative bridges service accessibility gaps, ensuring inclusivity in public administration.

Additionally, this study emphasizes the importance of emotional labor management for street-level bureaucrats (SLBs), who serve as the frontline intermediaries between the state and the public. Countries with high-intensity public service interactions, such as Japan, Brazil, and the Philippines, face similar pressures on their SLBs. The findings indicate that without adequate psychological support and stress management training, excessive emotional workload can diminish SLB effectiveness and hinder the sustainability of public service systems. Such support is crucial in fostering a more dynamic and efficient work environment, which in turn enhances the overall quality of public services (Hochschild, 1985).

This study also reinforces the relevance of the New Public Service framework (Denhardt and Denhardt, 2000), which advocates for citizen-oriented governance. This framework underscores the importance of involving the public in decision-making processes as a fundamental aspect of policy implementation. By engaging citizens from the planning stage through execution, governments can strengthen public trust in their institutions. For instance, countries such as Canada and Germany have demonstrated that dialogue-based models between governments and citizens not only enhance public satisfaction but also reinforce accountability and transparency.

Although rooted in the Indonesian context, the findings of this study hold global relevance in the discourse on effective policy implementation. This research contributes to the field of public administration by providing empirical insights into policy implementation dynamics within multicultural environments. Furthermore, it presents innovative strategies that can be adopted by countries facing similar challenges. In an increasingly complex world, approaches that emphasize adaptive governance, emotional support for SLBs, and public participation are essential steps to ensure that public policies deliver meaningful and sustainable impacts.

5.4 Implications for Policy and Practice

The findings of this study provide several practical recommendations to enhance the implementation of PTSP in Bondowoso and similar contexts:

1. Local Policy Adaptation
 - National policy frameworks should incorporate regional customization mechanisms, allowing local governments to tailor policies based on their unique conditions.
 - For example, in Bondowoso, local authorities can optimize coordination between front-office and back-office units to expedite administrative services.
2. Empowering Street-Level Bureaucrats (SLBs)
 - SLBs should be provided with adequate resources, training, and autonomy to effectively address local challenges.
 - Training programs in emotional management and public service technology, such as e-correspondence applications, can help SLBs navigate dual pressures—meeting public expectations while adhering to institutional regulations.

3. Technology Integration

- Investment in digital infrastructure is essential to streamline workflows, improve inter-unit communication, and enhance service transparency.
- Implementing document tracking systems or automating administrative processes can reduce manual bottlenecks and accelerate service delivery.

4. Citizen Engagement

- Establishing participatory governance mechanisms allows citizens to provide feedback and stay informed about policy implementation.
- Community forums and digital surveys can be used to identify public needs directly and foster a sense of ownership over public policies.

By implementing these recommendations, PTSP can transition into a more adaptive, efficient, and citizen-centered public service model, ultimately strengthening trust in public administration.

6. Conclusion

The issues identified in this study suggest a need for comprehensive reform strategies that prioritize local adaptability, capacity-building for SLBs, and participatory governance frameworks. The following conclusion summarizes the key recommendations for enhancing PTSP effectiveness in decentralized settings. To overcome challenges in public service policy implementation, a comprehensive training program is essential for street-level bureaucrats (SLBs). This training should focus on conflict resolution skills, stress management, and emotional resilience, which are critical to their demanding roles. Additionally, fostering a supportive organizational culture that recognizes the emotional labor of SLBs can enhance both performance and job satisfaction. Such support not only strengthens individual capacities but also enhances institutional effectiveness in delivering responsive and citizen-centered services.

A lack of community involvement in policy formulation often results in reduced service relevance and effectiveness. This disconnect fosters public disengagement and skepticism toward government initiatives. To address this, it is crucial to encourage active public participation in both the policy design and implementation phases. Dialogue forums involving SLBs, policymakers, and local communities can serve as a platform for identifying local needs, enhancing accountability, and strengthening transparency in public service delivery.

The implementation of PTSP in Bondowoso reflects broader challenges in translating top-down policies into effective local practices. This study highlights significant gaps in policy alignment, inter-unit coordination, and institutional support for SLBs. Issues such as slow administrative processes, emotional stress on frontline workers, and infrastructure limitations underscore the need for adaptive governance and institutional reform. By addressing these barriers, policymakers can enhance PTSP effectiveness and ensure that public services align more closely with local community needs.

This research contributes to the public administration literature by offering empirical insights into policy implementation dynamics within diverse cultural contexts. Furthermore, it opens avenues for comparative studies across different regions, long-term impact assessments of integrated service models, and explorations of digital technology's role in public service reform. By understanding both the challenges and opportunities in policy execution, this study provides a foundation for developing more effective approaches to improving public service quality.

This study provides a phenomenological insight into the challenges of implementing the One-Stop Integrated Service (PTSP) policy in Bondowoso, particularly in the religious service sector. Findings reveal that central policies often fail to accommodate local dynamics, leading to procedural inefficiencies, emotional strain on street-level bureaucrats (SLBs), and citizen dissatisfaction.

To address these issues, the study recommends strengthening cross-unit coordination, integrating technological tools such as real-time tracking systems and WhatsApp autoresponders, and empowering SLBs through tailored training. The results contribute to the broader discourse on adaptive governance and demonstrate that policy success depends not only on administrative design but also on responsiveness to local realities and inclusive stakeholder engagement.

Future research is encouraged to conduct comparative studies across different regions and policy domains to better understand the broader implications of top-down policy implementation in diverse sociocultural contexts.

Funding: This research received no external funding.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Publisher's Note: All claims expressed in this article are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of their affiliated organizations, or those of the publisher, the editors and the reviewers.

References

- [1] Batley, R., (2004). The Politics of Service Delivery Reform. *Dev. Change* 35, 31–56. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-7660.2004.00341.x>
- [2] Biswan, A.T., Wardani, F., (2017). Implementasi Just In Time Layanan Penerbitan Nomor Pokok Wajib Pajak. *J. Akunt. Multiparadigma* 8, 353–369. <https://doi.org/10.18202/jamal.2017.08.7059>
- [3] Brodtkin, E., (2011). Policy work: Street-level organizations under new managerialism. *J. Public Adm. Res.*
- [4] Carey, G., Crammond, B., Riley, T., (2015). Top-down approaches to joined-up government: examining the unintended consequences of weak implementation. ... *J. Public Adm.*
- [5] Cohen, J.M., (1993). Importance of Public Service Reform: the Case of Kenya. *J. Mod. Afr. Stud.* 31, 449–476. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022278X00012039>
- [6] Cosens, B.A., Craig, R.K., Hirsch, S.L., Arnold, C.A. (Tony), Benson, M.H., DeCaro, D.A., Garmestani, A.S., Gosnell, H., Ruhl, J.B., Schlager, E., (2017). The role of law in adaptive governance. *Ecol. Soc.* 22, art30. <https://doi.org/10.5751/ES-08731-220130>
- [7] Da Graca, B., Fleming, N.S., Ballard, D.J., (2020). Improving the Efficiency of Care, in: Sreeramaju, P.V., Weber, S.G., Snyder, A.A., Kirk, L.M., Reed, W.G., Hardy-Decuir, B.A. (Eds.), *The Patient and Health Care System: Perspectives on High-Quality Care*. Springer International Publishing, Cham, pp. 137–154. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-46567-4_11
- [8] Denhardt, R.B., Denhardt, J.V., (2000). The New Public Service: Serving Rather than Steering. *Public Adm. Rev.* 60, 549–559. <https://doi.org/10.1111/0033-3352.00117>
- [9] Ghuman, B.S., Singh, R., (2013). Decentralization and delivery of public services in Asia. *Policy Soc.* 32, 7–21. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.polsoc.2013.02.001>
- [10] Groenewald, T., (2004). A Phenomenological Research Design Illustrated. *Int. J. Qual. Methods* 3, 42–55. <https://doi.org/10.1177/160940690400300104>
- [11] Hochschild, A.R., (1985). The Managed Heart: Commercialization of Human Feeling. *Polit. Sci. Q.* 100, 176. <https://doi.org/10.1525/9780520951853>
- [12] Horridge, M., Wittwer, G., (2017). Top-Down Extensions to Represent Counties and Congressional Districts and Moving to Bottom-Up, in: Wittwer, G. (Ed.), *Multi-Regional Dynamic General Equilibrium Modeling of the U.S. Economy*, *Advances in Applied General Equilibrium Modeling*. Springer International Publishing, Cham, pp. 173–192. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-58866-7_10
- [13] Ikpe, U.B., (2004). Public culture and national integration in multi-cultural states Comparative observations from the United States and Nigeria. *Comp. Am. Stud. Int. J.* 2, 91–114. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1477570004041687>
- [14] Lipsky, M., (1981). Street-Level Bureaucracy: Dilemmas of the Individual in Public Services. *Mich. Law Rev.* 79, 811. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1288305>
- [15] Lipsky, M., (1981). Street-Level Bureaucracy: Dilemmas of the Individual in Public Services. *Mich. Law Rev.* 79, 811. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1288305>
- [16] MacCallum, N. (Ed.), (2008). *Implementation of the Local Development Strategy, Local Economic and Employment Development (LEED)*. OECD. <https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264044869-en>
- [17] Matland, R.E., (1995). Synthesizing the Implementation Literature: The Ambiguity-Conflict Model of Policy Implementation. *J. Public Adm. Res. Theory* 5, 145–174. <https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordjournals.jpart.a037242>
- [18] Mayunita, S., (2022). Evaluasi Kebijakan Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu (Studi pada Dinas Penanaman Modal dan Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu Provinsi Sulawesi Tenggara). *J. Ilm. Tata Sejuta STIA Mataram* 8, 188–199. <https://doi.org/10.32666/tatasejuta.v8i2.431>
- [19] Muthien, Y., (2020). PUBLIC SERVICE REFORM: KEY CHALLENGES OF EXECUTION. *Strateg. Rev. South. Afr.* 36. <https://doi.org/10.35293/srsa.v36i2.173>
- [20] Naim, M., (1998). Public Bureaucracies in Developing Countries: Ten Paradoxes. *Indian J. Public Adm.* 44, 727–731. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0019556119980345>
- [21] Narain, I., (1976). Cultural Pluralism, National Integration and Democracy in India. *Asian Surv.* 16, 903–917. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2643532>
- [22] Ordóñez-Ponce, E., (2023). The role of local cultural factors in the achievement of the sustainable development goals. *Sustain. Dev.* 31, 1122–1134. <https://doi.org/10.1002/sd.2445>
- [23] Rees, C., Hossain, F. (Eds.), (2013). *Public Sector Reform in Developing and Transitional Countries*, 0 ed. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203722220>
- [24] Sabatier, P., Mazmanian, D., (1980). The implementation of public policy: A framework of analysis. *Policy Stud. J.* 8, 538–560.
- [25] Tian, J., Tian, S., Ma, X., (2009). The Model about “One-Stop” E-Government Service Integration, in: 2009 International Conference on Management and Service Science. Presented at the 2009 International Conference on Management and Service Science (MASS), IEEE, Wuhan, pp. 1–4. <https://doi.org/10.1109/ICMSS.2009.5302521>
- [26] Wang, L., Zhao, F., Guo, H., Liu, X., Pedrycz, W., (2022). Top-Down Granulation Modeling Based on the Principle of Justifiable Granularity. *IEEE Trans. Fuzzy Syst.* 30, 701–713. <https://doi.org/10.1109/TFUZZ.2020.3046333>
- [27] Zagorodny, A., Bogdanov, V., Ermoliev, Y., Kulyk, M., (2023). Development of Top-down and Bottom-up Methodology Using Risk Functions for Systems with Multiplicity of Solutions, in: Zaporozhets, A. (Ed.), *Systems, Decision and Control in Energy IV, Studies in Systems, Decision and Control*. Springer Nature Switzerland, Cham, pp. 3–23. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-22464-5_1