
| RESEARCH ARTICLE

Category Shifts in The Indonesian Translation of The Emperor's New Clothes by Hans Christian Andersen

Muflihah¹ ✉ and Ahmad Jum'a Khatib Nur Ali²

¹Student of Master's Degree in Translation Studies English Department Gunadarma University, Jakarta, Indonesia

²Lecturer of Master's Degree in Translation Studies, English Department, Gunadarma University, Jakarta, Indonesia

Corresponding Author: Muflihah, **E-mail:** aryamufli059@gmail.com

| ABSTRACT

Translators often face problems in the process of translation. Many strategies are used to solve the problems, and one of the strategies is the shift, stated by Catford. The category shift consists of 4 (four) types, namely Structure Shift, Class Shift, Unit Shift, and Intra-System Shift. The purpose of this research is to find out and elaborate on the types of category shifts that occur in the Indonesian translation of the English version of The Emperor's New Clothes fairy tale. The scope of this research is the types of category shift found in the Indonesian Translation of the English version of The Emperor's New Clothes. This research uses a qualitative descriptive method, and the method of data collection in this research is document analysis. First, the researcher collects the data from both the ST and TT, comparing the shift that occurs in the sentence, then analyze the data and presents it in the form of text. From the analysis and discussion, it is concluded that shifts in the translation are necessary and unavoidable to produce a natural translation, so the readers will easily understand it.

| KEYWORDS

Translation, category shift, fairy tales, Catford's shift, translation strategy

| ARTICLE DOI: [10.32996/ijllt.2022.5.3.23](https://doi.org/10.32996/ijllt.2022.5.3.23)

1. Introduction

In literature works, fairy tales are one of the literature genres. They had been recited and repeated many times, even changed in some ways. As said by Warner (2018) that fairy tales are familiar stories, either verifiably old because they have been passed on down the generations. It is more familiar to tell fairy tales to the children as messages to do good deeds in a way they will remember. The words and language used in the story reflected some occasions or affairs that happened during the stories created. In this way, people remember the messages and moral values contained in the tales.

Fairy tales, as mentioned before, passed down through generations, influence society's point of view. The social constructions built in the stories set some standards on how people normally should behave, especially when the parents educate their children. "Fairy tales contribute to the formation of the boundaries of agency, subjectivity, and anticipated rewards" Tunku (2013). The Emperor's New Clothes is a fairy tale that was written by Hans Christian Andersen. He was a Danish author and famous for many literary works, especially fairy tales and short stories for children. The tale has a story about a king who was tricked by two weavers. The swindlers-weavers told the king that they could make an extraordinary cloth, which people who were either a fool or unfit for their office could see nothing. The real thing was the weavers did nothing at all. That was why everybody could not see anything. In the end, the king wore nothing in his procession as nobody admitted they could not see anything, including the king himself, as they did not want to be viewed as a fool or unfit for their office.

The words formed and used in fairy tales will have an effect on how they will be told in a foreign language. Fairy tales are not limited to the country where the story began; they had been adapted and translated to other languages. Translating literary works is conducted from the old times until present times. Literary works such as fairy tales can be complicated to translate, as they sometimes use different choices of words. It is known to the literary translators that translating literary texts can be complex and

the process is not just anchored in a linguistic transfer (Rossi, 2018). Some utterances, expressions, idioms in literary works cannot be translated without using special strategies to convey the same message in the target text from what is written in the source text. As there are some cultural words in the story, the form of the source language, and how the target language is differently structured, translating fairy tales is never a simple work.

There are some researchers who conducted research about shifts in translation. Darso (2018) conducted research entitled *Category Shifts in Translation: A Case Study on the Translation of English Complex Noun Phrases into Indonesian*. The study aims to identify the types of category shifts and explain their occurrence in the translation of complex noun phrases from English into Indonesian in *The Valley of Fear* Novel. The results of the study are structure shift occurs in the highest frequency of 339 cases or about 66,86% out of total 507 cases, a class shift occurs 75 cases or 14,79 % out of total 507 cases, and intra-system shift occurs 48 cases or 9,46 % out of total 507 cases, and a unit shift occurs 45 cases or 8,87 % out of total 507 cases. The other research concerning the shifts in translation was conducted by Nur Fitria (2020). This research aims to find out the types of shifts and to know the most dominant type of shifts found in the English to Indonesian subtitle of *Guzaarish* movie. From the discussion, it shows that the most dominant type of shift in *Guzaarish* movie subtitle is the category shift, especially the structural shift.

The purpose of this research is to find out and explain the types of category shifts applied in the Indonesian translation of the English version of *The Emperor's New Clothes* written by Hans Christian Andersen. The researcher uses a qualitative descriptive method by reading and comparing the texts, both in the source language and target language. After that, the researcher collects the data from both texts then describes what and how the strategy occurs in the translated text.

2. Literature Review

The translation is defined by many experts. The idea of translation stated by Newmark (1988) is a process of rendering the meaning of one text into another language as intended. A good translation can transfer the idea of the source text into the target text without lacking its original context and can be understood easily in the target text. Another definition stated by Cuddon (2013) stated that translation is an adaptation that retains the original spirit but may considerably alter style, structure, grammar, and idiom. In translating between one language to another, the translator is not merely giving another word in the target language, but the closest style, idiomatic expression and sometimes their cultural words.

In order to produce an understandable and natural translation, translators use some procedures or strategies. The strategy that is used by the researcher in this study is the shift. Shifts in translation, which means change in word class, unit, or even rank between the source text and target text, is unavoidable. This is because there are differences between both languages. According to Catford in Hatim & Munday (2004), there are two types of translation shifts they are level shift (between the levels of grammar and lexis) and category shift (unbounded and rank-bounded). The level shift means a change in an SL item at one linguistic level into a different level in the target text. This shift involves shifts from grammar to lexis and vice versa. For example, "She **has closed** her bakery" is translated into "*Dia **sudah** menutup toko rotinya.*" The present perfect tense (has+V3) in the English source text (ST) is translated into "*sudah*" in the Indonesian target text.

While the other shift, the category shift, means that an SL rank has a TL translation equivalent in other ranks, and may occur between sentences, clauses, groups, words, and (though rarely) morphemes scale (Catford, 1965). The category shift consists of 4 (types) of shifts, namely Structure Shift, Class Shift, Unit Shift, and Intra-System Shift. The first one is Structure Shift, which can possibly occur at all ranks. This shift involves the changes of structure between the ST and TT, such as Modifier-Head (MH) pattern in SL is translated into Head-Modifier (HM) pattern. For example, the phrase "**expensive car**" in English is translated into "***mobil mahal***" in Indonesian. The second shift is the Class shift, which involves the change of class between the ST and TT. For example, the sentence "They could no longer afford to keep Saiful at **school**" is translated into "*Mereka tidak sanggup **menyekolahkan** Saiful lagi.*" The English word "**school**" is a noun, while it is translated into "***menyekolahkan***" which is a verb in Indonesian. The third one is Unit Shift, which means the change of unit between the ST and TT, such as a word in ST changes into a phrase in TT, and vice versa. For example. The sentence "He **rearranged** the meeting schedule" is translated into "*Dia **mengatur kembali** jadwal meeting itu.*" It can be seen that a word in the ST is translated into a phrase in the TT. The last type from the Category Shift is Intra-System Shift, which often occurs in the form of numbers, such as the plural word in ST is translated into a singular word in the TT. For example, "The teacher has twenty **students** in the class" is translated into "*Guru itu mempunyai dua puluh **murid** di kelas.*" The word "**students**" in the ST is a plural word, and it is translated into "***murid***," which is a singular word.

3. Methodology

The researcher uses a qualitative descriptive method in this study. There is no numerical data presented, as the researcher describes and analyzes the data by explanation. According to Hancock, Ockleford, and Windridge (2007), qualitative research focuses on description and interpretation, and it focuses on data that cannot be adequately expressed numerically. Qualitative here means the translator focuses on explaining, analyzing, and describing the data found in the text form.

The first primary source for this research is the English version of the fairy tale entitled The Emperor's New Clothes by Hans Christian Andersen. The fairy tale is taken from Andersen's Fairy Tales book, published in 1939 by J. M. Dent & Sons Ltd, Aldine House. The English version is translated by Alice Lucas from the original Danish version. The second primary resource is the Indonesian version of the same fairy tale entitled *Pakaian Baru Kaisar*, taken from the book *Kumpulan Dongeng Andersen*, published in 2012 by Gramedia Pustaka Utama. It is translated by Listiana Srisanti from the English version of the fairy tale. While the secondary source is the books related to the theories and analysis to support the researcher's data.

The method of data collection in this research is document analysis. It is a data collection method that contains the analysis of the data taken from written or textual documents. According to Frey (2018),

Document analysis is a form of qualitative research that uses a systematic procedure to analyze documentary evidence and answer specific research questions. Similar to other methods of analysis in qualitative research, document analysis requires repeated review, examination, and interpretation of the data in order to gain meaning and empirical knowledge of the construct being studied.

The translator collects the sentences that have a shift strategy, classify them to the correct type of shift then compares the English text and Indonesia translated text. After that, the researcher analyzes some data to represent the shifts that occur in the sentence then presents the findings and results.

4. Result and Discussion

The shift in translation is unavoidable in order to produce a natural translation. As most likely, the structure and form of the ST and TT are different; the shift is necessary to be done. The collected data will be analyzed with the theory of shift by Catford (1965). The scope of this research is the data that use the category shift type: Structure, Unit, Class, and Intra-System. Due to the allotted time, the data analyzed here are chosen to represent the common shift occurring.

4.1 Structure Shift

Structure shift involves the changes of structure between the ST and TT. Category shifts can occur in grammatical structures, for example, the order in the word structure that has shifted in TT with a different structure. It is unavoidable, considering that the ST and TT (in this case, English and Indonesian) have different structures. The example data for the shift can be seen below.

Datum 1

| Source Text (English) | Target Text (Indonesia) |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| At the outset, they asked for a quantity of the finest silk and the purest gold thread... | <i>Mereka meminta sutera paling halus dan benang-benang emas murni.</i> |

The phrase **finest silk** in the ST is translated into **sutera paling halus** in the TT. The structure of the ST's phrase is pre-modifier (finest) + Head (gold), while in the TT, the phrase structure becomes Head (*sutera*) + post-modifier (*paling halus*). Here in this sentence, there is a structural shift between the structure of Modifier + Head in the ST into the structure of Head + Modifier in the translated text.

Datum 2

| Source Text (English) | Target Text (Indonesia) |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| ... they worked away at the empty looms far into the night. | <i>... mereka meneruskan bekerja di depan perkakas tenun kosong sampai jauh malam.</i> |

The phrase **empty looms** in the ST is translated into **perkakas tenun kosong** in the TT. The structure of the ST's phrase is Modifier (empty) + Head (looms), while in the TT, the phrase structure becomes Head (*perkakas tenun*) + Modifier (*kosong*). Here in this sentence, there is a structure shift between the structure of Modifier + Head in the ST into the structure of Head + Modifier in the translated text.

Datum 3

| Source Text (English) | Target Text (Indonesia) |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| "I will send my faithful old minister to the weavers," thought the Emperor. | <i>"Aku akan mengirim perdana menteriku yang setia," akhirnya Kaisar memutuskan.</i> |

The phrase **my faithful old minister** in the ST is translated into **perdana menteriku yang setia** in the TT. The structure of the ST's phrase is a determiner (my) + first modifier (faithful) + second modifier (old) + head (minister), while in the TT, the structure becomes Head (perdana menteriku) + post-modifier (*yang setia*). Here in this sentence, there is a structure shift between the structure of determiner + modifier + head in the ST into the structure of head + modifier in the translated text.

4.2 Class Shift

Unlike the structure shift, which involves the change of grammatical patterns of linguistic items, a class shift occurs when the class of any linguistic elements in the source language shifts into a different class of words in the target language. There is a change between the word class of ST and TT.

Datum 4

| Source Text (English) | Target Text (Indonesia) |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Many years ago, there was an Emperor who was so excessively fond of new clothes ... | Bertahun-tahun yang lalu, ada seorang kaisar yang amat gemar berpakaian baru. |

The type of category shift that occurs here is a class shift. The word **clothes** in English ST is a noun, and it translated into **berpakaian**, which is a verb in Indonesian. Here, a class shift happens, that is, a change of class between the ST and the TT (noun to verb).

Datum 5

| Source Text (English) | Target Text (Indonesia) |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Everybody in the town knew what wonderful power the stuff possessed... | Semua orang sudah mendengar tentang keajaiban kain itu ... |

The type of category shift that occurs here is a class shift. The word **wonderful** in English, ST, is an adjective, and it translated into **keajaiban**, which is a noun in Indonesian. Here, a class shift happens, that is, a change of class between the ST and the TT (adjective to noun).

Datum 6

| Source Text (English) | Target Text (Indonesia) |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|
| "Good heavens!" thought he, "is it possible that I am a fool ." | "Astaga!" pikirnya. "Apakah aku ini bodoh ?" |

The type of category shift that occurs here is a class shift. The word **fool** in English ST is a noun, and it is translated into **bodoh**, which is an adjective in Indonesian. Here, a class shift happens, that is, a change of class between the ST and the TT (noun to adjective).

Datum 7

| Source Text (English) | Target Text (Indonesia) |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Everybody in the town was talking about this splendid stuff. | Seluruh kota ramai membicarakan kehebatan kain yang sedang ditenun untuk Kaisar. |

The type of category shift that occurs here is a class shift. The word **splendid** in English ST is an adjective, and it translated into **kehebatan**, which is a noun in Indonesian. Here, a class shift happens, that is, a change of class between the ST and the TT (adjective to noun).

4.3 Unit Shift

A unit shift is the change of rank of linguistic items of the ST when it is translated into the TT. It occurs at the level of a morpheme, word, phrase, clause, or sentence. The change can be from the higher rank into the lower one, such as phrase into word, or from the lower unit into the higher unit such as phrase into clause or sentence.

Datum 8

| Source Text (English) | Target Text (Indonesia) |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| By wearing them, I should be able to discover which men in my kingdom are unfitted for their posts . | "Jika aku punya pakaian semacam itu, aku akan segera tahu siapa-siapa di antara bawahanku yang tidak sesuai untuk jabatannya ." |

The type of category shift that occurs here is a unit shift. **Unfitted** in the English ST is a word, and it translated into **tidak sesuai**, which is a phrase in Indonesian. On the contrary, the second datum in the sentence, **their posts** which is a phrase, is translated into a word in Indonesian, that is **jabatannya**.

Datum 9

| Source Text (English) | Target Text (Indonesia) |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| They did put up two looms and pretended to weave, but they had nothing whatever upon their shuttles. | Kedua penipu ini menyiapkan dua buah perkakas tenun dan berpura-pura sibuk bekerja, walaupun sebenarnya tak ada apa-apa pada perkakas tenun itu. |

Similar to the previous datum, the type of category shift that occurs here is a unit shift between words into a phrase. **Nothing** in the English ST is a word, and it translated into **tak ada**, which is a phrase in Indonesian.

Datum 10

| Source Text (English) | Target Text (Indonesia) |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Both the swindlers begged him to be good enough to step a little nearer and asked if he did not think it a good pattern and beautiful colouring. | Kedua penipu dengan sopan memintanya untuk lebih mendekat dan bertanya apakah dia menyukai coraknya dan bukankah warnanya indah sekali. |

In this sentence, there are two data that show the unit shift strategy. **Begged him** in the English ST is a phrase, and it translated into **memintanya**, which is a word in Indonesian. Similar to the first datum, the second datum in the sentence, **their posts** which is a phrase, is translated into a word in Indonesian, that is **jabatannya**.

4.4 Intra-System Shift

The last type of category shift is an intra-system shift. It occurs when the plural linguistic items in the ST are translated into singular linguistic items in the TT, or vice versa. The examples of this category are presented in the data below.

Datum 11

| Source Text (English) | Target Text (Indonesia) |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| At the outset, they asked for a quantity of the finest silk and the purest gold thread ... | Mereka meminta sutera paling halus dan benang-benang emas murni. |

The word **thread** in the ST is translated into **benang-benang** in the TT. Thread in English is a singular word, while **benang-benang** in Indonesian is a plural word, which means the item is more than one. The intra-system shift in the sentence occurs between a singular word into a plural word.

Datum 12

| Source Text (English) | Target Text (Indonesia) |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| ... they worked away at the empty looms far into the night. | ... mereka meneruskan bekerja di depan perkakas tenun kosong sampai jauh malam. |

The word **looms** in the ST is translated into **perkakas tenun** in the TT. **Looms** in English is a plural word, while **perkakas tenun** in Indonesian is a singular word. The intra-system shift in the sentence occurs between a plural word into a singular word.

Datum 13

| Source Text (English) | Target Text (Indonesia) |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| ... they stitched away with needles without any thread in them. | Mereka ... menggantung udara dengan gunting besar dan menjahit dengan jarum tanpa benang. |

The word **needles** in the ST is translated into **jarum** in the TT. **Needles** in English is a plural word, while **jarum** in Indonesian is a singular word. The intra-system shift in the sentence occurs between a plural word into a singular word.

The analyzed data above show that category shift often occurs in the translated text, in this case, a translation of a fairy tale. The decision to use the shift strategy in translation occurs when the translated text is not giving the same style of meaning if the SL text is translated literally. In this case, literary work such as a fairy tale often uses a unique style of writing from other kinds of text, so some strategies will be needed to transfer the meaning of the source text.

5. Conclusion

The aim of this research is to find out and elaborate on the types of category shifts that occur in the Indonesian translation of the English version of Andersen's The Emperor's New Clothes fairy tale. There are 13 (thirteen) data that has been collected from both ST and TT to represent the shift in the fairy tale entitled The Emperor's New Clothes by Hans Christian Andersen. From the findings, discussion, and analysis in the previous chapter, the researcher concludes that a shift in translation is necessary and unavoidable. The structure between the ST and TT is different, so the translator needs to make some shifts either in structure, unit, class, or intra-system in the TT. This is conducted in order to produce a natural translation so that the translation will be accurately transferred in TT. When the translation is accurate, it will be acceptable and readable so the readers will easily understand it.

This conducted research is another proof that translating literary works needs some strategies. It only covers Catford's strategy of shift that focuses on category shift. However, further research is needed in this study, so the other aspect of translation can be covered more completely. It can be the other type of shift or the other strategies in translating literary work such as fairy tales.

Funding: This research received no external funding.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

- [1] Andersen, H. C., & Lucas, A. (1939). *Fairy Tales from Hans Christian Andersen (Andersen's Fairy Tales)* (First). New York, London: J. M. Dent & Sons, Ltd., Aldine House - E. P. Dutton & Co.
- [2] Andersen, H. C., & Srisanti, L. (2012). *Kumpulan Dongeng Andersen*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- [3] Catford, J. C. (1965). *A Linguistic Theory of Translation*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- [4] Cuddon, J. A. (2013). *A Dictionary of Literary Terms and Literary Theories*. Sussex: Blackwell.
- [5] Darso, D. (2018). Category Shifts in Translation: A Case Study on The Translation Of English Complex Noun Phrases into Indonesian. *Lingua Scientia*, 25(1).
- [6] Frey, B. B. (2018). The SAGE encyclopedia of educational research, measurement, and evaluation. In SAGE. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781506326139>
- [7] Hatim, B., & Munday, J. (2004). *Translation, An advanced resource book*. Oxon: Routledge.
- [8] Newmark, P. (1988). *A Textbook of Translation*. Hertfordshire: Prentice-Hall International.
- [9] Nur-Fitria, T. (2020). Translation Shift in English into Indonesian Subtitle of Guzaarish Movie. *Journal of Language and Literature*, 20(2), 307–317. <https://doi.org/10.24071/joll.v20i2.2601>
- [10] Rossi, C. (2018). *The Routledge Handbook of Literary Translation*. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315517131-4>
- [11] Tanku, P. (2013). Translation Implication for Cultural and Literary Equivalence in Translating Fairy Tales. *Academic Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies*, 2(2), 463–470. <https://doi.org/10.5901/ajis.2013.v2n2p463>
- [12] Warner, M. (2018). *Fairy Tale: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.