

---

**RESEARCH ARTICLE**

**Footnotes in an Indonesian Source Text and in an English Target Text**

Erlina Zulkifli Mahmud<sup>1</sup> ✉ and Bima Bayusena<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup>Faculty of Cultural Sciences, Universitas Padjadjaran, Bandung, Indonesia

**Corresponding Author:** Erlina Zulkifli Mahmud, **E-mail:** [erlina@unpad.ac.id](mailto:erlina@unpad.ac.id)

---

**ABSTRACT**

This research is about the use of footnotes in an Indonesian source text and in an English target text. It involves a translation of literary work called a novel from Indonesian into English. The novel deals with some cultures; Arabic/Islamic culture applied in Islamic boarding school, Minangkabau culture, and Indonesian culture. That is why the author needs to strengthen information using footnotes regarding some terms or words in his novel. When or which words need to be put as footnotes depend on the author's preference, and this is also what occurs in the target text; the translator has her own preference whether to keep the footnotes as footnotes in her target text or insert them as additional information in the text. The footnotes in the source text are almost four times outnumbered the footnotes in the target text. Using the descriptive qualitative method, this research is to give a description of the translation of footnotes into footnotes and about the information provided in the footnotes either in the source text or in the target text. And using Translation Studies in analyzing the data, this research is to find out the procedures of translation involved in the translation from footnotes into footnotes. The results show that translating footnotes into footnotes cannot use only one single procedure; it needs at least a combination of two procedures, namely couplets, or of three procedures, namely triplets, and quadruplets, a combination of four procedures; and the footnoted words or terms or sentences provide information mostly about Arabic daily conversation between a teacher and his students at school and about address terms used in Minangkabau language.

**KEYWORDS**

Couplets, footnotes, literary translation, procedures of translation, triplets, quadruplets

**ARTICLE DOI:** [10.32996/ijllt.2022.5.1.23](https://doi.org/10.32996/ijllt.2022.5.1.23)

---

**1. Introduction**

The use of footnotes dealing with additional information is one of the ways to solve the problem of translating very specific or unique words such as cultural words, cultural terms, and proper names. Strengthened by Newmark that mostly the words or terms footnoted carry cultural, technical, linguistic meaning (Newmark, 1988). The term footnotes represent the location of the information given that is put at the foot or bottom of a page. Research articles specifically about footnotes functioning as a provider of additional information may not be as popular as other topics. This is not a subjective opinion as the statement can be supported by the fact that the number of research about this topic is limited using the Google search engine. We cannot find that research easily. It is assumed that footnotes are less important as they are put outside the story frame; secondly, they are given at the bottom of a page as part of the footer. This means it is just a supplement element to a text. Readers may just skip this information when they are aware that it is excluded from the text, and it will not distort the wholeness of the story.

What can be found in the data source, an Indonesian novel, *Negeri 5 Menara*, is the phenomenon that shows that the author prefers to use footnotes to strengthen additional information to the words, terms, and sentences assuming they are not familiar or too familiar unique to the readers. The novel involves several cultures; Minangkabau culture, Arabic culture dealing with Islamic boarding school, and Indonesian culture. Some readers may know about words or terms put in the footnotes, but some or even many may have no knowledge at all about the footnoted words or terms. This shows how footnotes are needed. As the main function of footnotes in literary translation is to give additional information to the words or terms footnoted, which are mostly

cultural or technical, this may help the work of a translator. The fact that the information about cultural or technical words or terms used is already there in the text, a translator just needs to translate the information given. A translator may not need to search for information about the cultural words or terms anymore.

Opposing to the condition in the source text, in its English target text, *The Land of Five Towers*, footnotes are less used. This means that not all footnotes in the source text are translated into footnotes again in the target text. Some are inserted directly in the text as part of the story. The case of footnotes in the data source is getting more interesting due to the fact that some of the footnotes in the target text are the translator's preferences. This reveals that some of the footnotes in the target text are not the equivalents of footnotes in the source text.

The data source, the novel, has been studied by Indonesian researchers and scholars ever since it was published the first time. The number of research regarding this novel and its translation is high as it can be found easily. To show the position of this research, there are several previous types of research used as references. This can be divided into three parts: (1) the previous research about the data source, (2) the previous research involving the use of Newmark's translation procedures, and (3) the previous research about footnotes. The previous research about the data source was taken from the most recent publication: firstly, when the novel *Negeri 5 Menara* and its translation are used as the data source in a prosiding article dealing with the use of Baker's translation strategies in translating Minangkabau cultural words (Mahmud, 2018). This article focuses on the translation of Minangkabau cultural words only, and the data are studied by using Baker's strategies of translation, not Newmark's translation procedures. Secondly, the data source is used in a journal article focusing on translation equivalences of Islamic terms only, and it is Molina and Albir's techniques of translation applied (Zulkifli Mahmud et al., 2020). Thirdly, almost the same as the second article, when the same novel and its translation are used as the data source in a journal article dealing with added and reduced information (Hermawan & Tanjung, 2018). Newmark's method and procedures of translation are applied in this research. So far, the study about the existence of footnotes in the novel has never been done yet.

The most recent publication on the use of Newmark's translation procedures was found in a journal article discussing the translation of cultural words in a novel *Tarian Bumi 'Earth Dance'* (Rahayu, 2021). This research uses translation procedures as the main theory for data analysis and translation equivalences. The next previous research still involves the use of Newmark's translation procedures, also found in journal articles but not dealing with literary works; this research uses legal documents of a private bank in the translation of banking terms (Buansari et al., 2020). Unlike the first research, in this research, the theory which is used only procedures of translation by Newmark. The third research involving Newmark's translation procedures is also found in a journal article dealing with the translation of abstracts written by post-graduate students in a private university in Indonesia (Carolia, 2019). It can be overviewed that Newmark's procedures of the translation may be applied in various kinds of text, ranging from a literary text to legal document and scientific text. The translation procedures that are studied in this research focus on couplets, triplets, and quadruplets, a combination of two, three, and four procedures.

The last part of the previous research used as references is the previous research about footnotes. There is only one that can be found using the Google search engine, and it is a journal article. The research talks about footnotes in a literary work, a novel translated from English into Malay (Haroon, 2019). She focuses on literary translation when she specifies the chapter on footnotes in the translated text. Unlike Haroon's work, this research focuses on the translation of footnotes into footnotes again from Indonesian into English.

The limited number of research about footnotes in Translation Studies and the unbalanced number of footnotes in the source text and in the target text becomes the major background of this research. Based on those backgrounds, the aims of this research cover three things. They are (1) to reveal what words, terms or sentences are put as the subject of the footnotes, (2) to find out what kind of information is given in the footnotes, and (3) to identify what procedures of translation are involved.

## 2. Literature Review

This part focuses on two major things: footnotes and Newmark's procedures of translation. Footnotes in this research are mostly used to provide additional information, not other functions. As it deals with a literary work, a novel, this kind of translation is called literary translation. Literary translation deals with the translation of literary works such as poetry, plays, novels (Torres, 2013). The translation itself, either literary or not, is to reproduce the message of the source language into the target language as closest as possible, as natural as possible both in terms of meaning and style (Nida, 1982). Translating literary works as a novel is challenging as there are some problems a translator needs to overcome; linguistic aspects, cultural aspects, and literature aspects (Hartono, 2014). One of the ways to give a solution to the three is by providing footnotes, especially when dealing with cultural aspects.

When used as an equivalent in a target text, Footnotes are simply called notes. The term footnotes usually pair with endnotes as part of citation style. There are two functions of footnotes: as a form of citation style and as a provider of additional information

(Gahan, 2018). The second function is the case we are talking about in this research. Notes as used in translation cover several different forms: in-text annotations, footnotes, endnotes or glossary entries (Haroon, 2019). The forms depend on the location; in-text annotations located inside a text footnotes located at the footer of a text, endnotes or glossary entries located at the end of the whole text. This research discusses only notes located at the footer of a text both in the source text and the target text.

The main theory dealing with Translation Studies used for the data analysis is Newmark's translation procedures. Newmark's translation procedures consist of (1) literal translation, (2) transference, (3) naturalization, (4) cultural equivalent, (5) functional equivalent, (6) descriptive equivalent, (7) synonymy, (8) through translation, (9) shifts or transpositions, (10) modulation, (11) recognised translation, (12) translation label, (13) compensation, (14) componential analysis, (15) reduction and expansion, (16) paraphrase, (17) couplets, (18) notes, addition, glosses (Newmark, 1988). Newmark classifies them into 18 categories, but in the application, the 15th category, reduction and expansion, the 17th category, couplets, which actually consists of couplets, triplets, quadruplets and the 18th category, notes, addition, glosses; they work individually. There are 18 categories of them, yet what is going to be discussed here is only eight procedures as found in the data: literal translation, transference, shifts or transpositions, modulation, reduction and expansion, paraphrase, couplets, including triplets and quadruplets, and notes, addition, glosses.

### **2.1 Literal Translation**

Not many researchers know that the first translation procedure is literal translation as it is not stated in *The Other Translation Procedures*. In Newmark's book, this procedure is put into one individual chapter as it is considered to be the most important procedure, and it is the basic translation procedure. This procedure can be found in the data used in this research. Translating footnotes using literal translation is possible and natural when the syntactic structure of the source language and the target language is the same or almost the same or when what is used is a simple sentence, for example, I love you (SVO) can be translated into Indonesian language using the same syntactic structure '*Saya cinta kamu*' (Erlina, 2016).

### **2.2 Transference**

This translation procedure refers to a procedure when a word or term in the source language text is transferred exactly the same as a loan word or borrowing. In the case of translating footnotes, this procedure is used almost in all data dealing with the words or terms or sentences footnoted. For example, *silat* (Indonesian traditional martial arts) is translated using transference into *silat* again.

### **2.3 Shifts or Transpositions**

When there is a different system between the grammar of the source language and the target language, this translation procedure can be applied. This includes the change from singular into plural and vice versa, from noun to verb and vice versa, one of the examples is when a noun, a call, in **Give me a call** is translated into a verb '*telepon*' in *Telepon saya*. ; next shift is from a word to a phrase, from one sentence into two sentences. The changes in parts of speech, in-unit, in structure deal with this translation procedure.

### **2.4 Modulation**

This translation procedure is almost the same with shifts or transpositions. The difference is that shifts or transpositions deal only with the grammatical case while modulation deals with meaning. Modulation relates to different perspectives or viewpoints. This covers active into passive and vice versa, cause into effect and vice versa, part for the whole, abstract for concrete, and some others.

### **2.5 Reduction and Expansion**

It can be said that the reduction translation procedure is more or less the same with deletion (omission) by suppressing source text information (Molina & Albir, 2002), and expansion is more or less the same with addition.

### **2.6 Paraphrase**

This translation procedure deals with the changes in the form but is similar in meaning or message. The form in the target text can be shorter but mostly longer; for example, *Aku akan memburunya sampai nafasku habis* is translated into **I'd chase her until the end**. Where *nafasku habis* 'out of breath' into **until the end** (Mahmud et al., 2021).

### **2.7 Couplets**

This translation procedure refers to the use of a combination of two procedures dealing with one problem, for example, transference with descriptive equivalent when the name of Indonesian food *sambal bajak* is translated into '**fried hot pepper sauce, sambal bajak**' (Mahmud, 2021). Under this category, there are two other more procedures, namely triplets and quadruplets. Triplets is a combination of three translation procedures dealing with one problem, while quadruplets is a combination of four translation procedures. Triplets are the most frequently revealed in the data.

## 2.8 Notes, Addition, Glosses

Notes deals with the translation of footnotes and in-text annotation and endnotes. What is being discussed in this research is only notes as the procedure of translating footnotes into footnotes again.

## 3. Methodology

The method used for this research is a descriptive-qualitative one. It is qualitative as it refers to any research which leads to words, images, or non-numeric symbols (George, 2008). What is studied here is words in the form of footnotes both in the source text and in the target text. While It is a descriptive method, the major purpose of this research is the description of the states of affairs as it exists at present (Kothari, 2004). The result of this research is in the form of a description in words. The procedures and steps carried out in this research are put in order as follow.

- (1) All data regarding the use of footnotes in the source text are collected and organized in a table.
- (2) The superscript numbers attached to the footnoted words or terms or sentences indicate the order and quantity of the footnotes. This is used as numbering data in a table.
- (3) The page number where footnotes are found is also noted in the table. This makes it easy to find the equivalent in the target text as one of the preparation before doing the analysis.
- (4) After documenting all the data into tables, the next work moves to the target text.
- (5) The same thing done in the source text is also performed in the target text. All collected data are put in a separate table.
- (6) After completing the collecting of data in the target text, then comparing work begins.
- (7) Each footnote in the source text is matched with its equivalent in the target text. It is done to all data, including those which are translated into non-footnotes.
- (8) The footnotes, which are translated into footnotes again in the target text, are collected and put in a separate table.
- (9) The table is the starting point of the work of this research. What words or terms or sentences which are footnoted both in the source text and in the target text are noted then analyzed based on (a) what words or terms or sentences footnoted ; (b) what information is given in the footnotes ; (c) what translation procedures are involved in the notes.
- (10) The footnotes which are found in the target text, not as the equivalents of the footnotes in the source text, are collected and put in a separate table. From this collected data, the words, terms, and sentences that are footnoted and the information given are documented to find out the kind of information given in the footnotes by the translator.
- (11) The work of step 9 is then distributed into 3 tables based on the application of translation procedures revealed in the notes; couplets, triplets, and quadruplets. No footnotes are found in the data, which are translated using a single translation procedure.
- (12) The final step is to put the results of the analysis into a description to be written as a journal article.

## 4. Results and Discussion

Based on the data collected from both texts, it can be identified the following phenomena as the first finding regarding the frequent use of footnotes. They are put in Table 1.

Table 1. The Quantity of Footnotes

No.	Description	Quantity
1	Footnotes in the Source Text	75
2	Footnotes in the Target Text	28
3	Footnotes Translated into Footnotes	19
4	Footnotes by Translator's Preference	9

Table 1 shows that only 25.33% of footnotes are translated into footnotes again, but the number in the target text is more than that as the translator makes her own footnotes by her preferences. The quantity of footnotes written in the superscript number in the source text is actually 77, as seen in the last data in the novel. However, from footnotes with superscript number 67, the next footnotes are with the superscript number 69. This shows that two numbers have been accidentally skipped, which means manually counted; the number of footnotes is only 75.

The words or terms or sentences which are footnoted in the source text cover (i) Arabic words or terms or sentences, (ii) words or terms or sentences of Minangkabau language, (iii) Indonesian words or terms, and (iv) words or terms from other languages as seen in Table 2.

Table 2. Words or Terms or Sentences Footnoted in the Source Text

No.	Description	Quantity
1	Arabic Words or Terms or Sentences	45
2	Words or Terms or Sentences from Minangkabau language	20
3	Indonesian Words or Terms	5
4	Words or Terms from Other Languages	5

From Table 2, it can be seen that the footnoted words or terms or sentences involve eight languages; the other five languages are four foreign languages and one local language consisting of Sundanese (one of the local languages in Indonesia) in a term Urang Sunda 'Sundanese people', Turkish in the name of pastry, Baklava, Japanese in a term in photographic bokeh, Chinese in a term for businessman, tauke, and English in the name of the dessert, ice cream with date. The highest number of words or terms or sentences footnoted in the source text is Arabic words or terms or sentences. While from the target text, it is found that the footnoted words or terms by translator's preference involve two languages; two data of Arabic language and seven data of Indonesian language.

The kind of information given in the footnotes in the source text involves daily conversation, names of Muslim scholars, names of school, address terms, foods, acronyms, names of organization or building, music instruments. On the other hand, in the target text, the footnoted words or terms or sentences added by the translator involve daily conversation, names of Muslim scholars, address terms, another term, idiomatic expression. The details about the information can be seen in the data analysis.

The data analysis using Translation Studies is limited to the data of footnotes translated into footnotes again. Although the translation of footnotes into footnotes again belongs to one of the translation procedures, namely notes as, in notes, addition, glosses, this research does not stop there. The details in the footnotes starting from the words or terms or sentences footnoted until the information is given there are analyzed more using Newmark's translation procedures apart from just notes. The footnotes that have been translated into footnotes again using notes translation procedure involve more than one procedure. It can be identified that there are at least two procedures combined together in translating one single footnote. Therefore the 19 data of footnotes translated into footnotes again are classified into three parts : (1) Translating Footnotes Using Couplets ; (2) Translating Footnotes Using Triplets ; (3) Translating Footnotes Using Quadruplets as stated in Table 3, Table 4, and Table 5.

Table 3. Translating Footnotes Using Couplets

No.	Footnotes in the Source Text	Footnotes in the Target Text	Translation Procedures
1	<i>Ashaabi</i> <sup>57</sup> <sup>57</sup> Saudara-saudara	<i>Ashaabi</i> <sup>16</sup> <sup>16</sup> brothers	Transference and Literal Translation
2	<i>License</i> <sup>77</sup> <sup>77</sup> Gelar S1 dari universitas di Arab Saudi	<i>License</i> <sup>28</sup> <sup>28</sup> Bachelor's degree from universities in Saudi Arabia	Transference and Shifts or Transpositions

The footnotes in Table 3 are translated using a combination of two translation procedures, namely couplets. In data (1), the information is about an Arabic word. It is a noun, a plural noun having the meaning of *saudara-saudara* in reduplication, which is equal to brothers in English. The translation involves a combination of two translation procedures. The first procedure is transference as the Arabic word *Ashaabi* is transferred exactly the same as a loan, *Ashaabi*. The second procedure is literal translation as the information in the footnotes *saudara-saudara* as a plural noun is translated into a plural noun also, **brothers**.

Moving to the next data, the footnoted word in data (2) *License* contains the information about the term for bachelor degree given by universities in Saudi Arabia. As in data (1), the translation involves two translation procedures used together as a combination. The first procedure is transference as the word or term *License* is transferred directly into the target text without making any changes in the spelling as a loan, *License*. The information in the footnotes involves the use of noun phrases, so it needs a shift or transposition to make the translation acceptable. Indonesian and English do not have the same noun phrase structure; *gelar S1* is a noun phrase with *gelar* 'degree' as the head put before *S1* 'bachelor' the modifier while in the source text, the head, **degree**, is put after the modifier, **bachelor** in possessive form. The next case of shift or transposition is when the word *universitas* 'university', a singular noun, is translated into plural universities.

The next data, which are put in Table 4, deals with the translation of footnotes into footnotes again using a combination of three translation procedures, namely triplets.

Table 4. Translating Footnotes Using Triplets

No.	Footnotes in the Source Text	Footnotes in the Target Text	Translation Procedures
1	<i>Haaza kitaabun</i> <sup>32</sup> <sup>32</sup> Ini buku (Arab)	<i>Haaza kitabbun</i> <sup>7</sup> <sup>7</sup> This is a book (Arabic)	Transference, literal translation, and Expansion
2	<i>Kaifa Arabiyatuka ya akhi. Khalas, lancar?</i> <sup>37</sup> <sup>37</sup> Bagaimana bahasa Arab kamu?	<i>Kaifa Arabiyatuka ya akhi. Khalas, lancar?</i> <sup>8</sup> <sup>8</sup> How's your Arabic?	Transference, Expansion, and Shift or Transposition
3	<i>Aadi faqad. Sedikit-sedikit, astathi</i> <sup>38</sup> <sup>38</sup> Iya biasa aja, sudah bisa sedikit-sedikit (dalam grammar yang kurang tepat).	<i>Aadi faqad. Sedikit-sedikit, astathi</i> <sup>9</sup> <sup>9</sup> Yeah, it's OK. I can speak a little bit (using incorrect grammar)	Transference, Shifts or Transpositions, and Expansion
4	<i>Syukron ya ikhwani lihudurikum</i> <sup>47</sup> <sup>47</sup> Terima kasih untuk kedatangan <b>kalian</b>	<i>Syukron ya ikhwani lihudurikum</i> <sup>12</sup> <sup>12</sup> Thank you for coming	Transference, Literal Translation, and Reduction
5	<i>Sip</i> <sup>55</sup> <sup>55</sup> <i>Sip</i> adalah kependekan dari si pengirim. Sering dipakai <b>di korespondensi surat</b> waktu itu.	<i>Sip</i> <sup>14</sup> <sup>14</sup> <i>Sip</i> is an abbreviation for from the sender, often used at that time.	Transference and Reduction, Shift or Transposition
6	<i>Randang kariang jo kantang</i> <sup>56</sup> <sup>56</sup> Rendang yang sudah menghitam dan semua bumbu meresap ke dalam daging dan <b>kentang kecil karena dipanaskan berkali-kali</b> . Rendang seperti sangat tahan lama dan rasanya sangat khas.	<i>Randang kariang jo kantang</i> <sup>15</sup> <sup>15</sup> Rendang that is already blackened with the meat and <b>potatoes</b> already marinated in the spices. Rendang like this can last for a very long time and has a very distinctive flavour.	Transference, Shifts or Transposition, Reduction
7	<i>Tafadhal</i> <sup>61</sup> <sup>61</sup> Silakan	<i>Tafadhal</i> <sup>17</sup> <sup>17</sup> Please ( <b>Arabic</b> )	Transference, Literal Translation, and Expansion
8	<i>Kulukum ra'in wakullukum masulun an raiyatih</i> <sup>63</sup> <sup>63</sup> Setiap orang itu pemimpin, dan setiap orang bertanggung-jawab atas apa yang <b>dipimpinnya</b> .	<i>Kulukum ra'in wakullukum masulun an raiyatih</i> <sup>18</sup> <sup>18</sup> Each person is a leader, and each person is responsible for what they <b>lead</b> .	Transference, Expansion, and Modulation
9	Ibnu Batutah <sup>64</sup> <sup>64</sup> Penjelajah dunia abad pertengahan. Pernah mengadakan perjalanan ke Samudera Pasai.	Ibnu Batutah <sup>19</sup> <sup>19</sup> <b>Also spelled Ibn Batuta. A medieval Moroccan Berber world explorer who traveled to the kingdom of Pasai off the coast of Sumatra.</b>	Transference, Expansion, and Shifts or Transpositions
10	<i>Ghosab</i> <sup>65</sup> <sup>65</sup> Menggunakan atau mengambil sandal orang lain tanpa izin. PM sangat ketat dalam disiplin <b>penggunaan hak orang lain</b> . Tanpa <b>izin yang punya bisa disimpulkan pencurian dan bisa bermuara pemulangan</b> .	<b>I hadn't used anyone slippers without their permission</b> <sup>20</sup> <sup>20</sup> <b>MP's rule</b> was very strict in discipline <b>when it came to the rights of others</b> . Without <b>the owner's permission, this kind of violation</b> may be taken as stealing and could result in expulsion.	Expansion, Paraphrase, Shift or Transposition
11	<i>Balerong</i> <sup>66</sup> <sup>66</sup> Kantor Wali Nagari. Wali nagari adalah <b>jabatan khas di kampung-kampung Minangkabau</b> . Fungsinya hampir sama dengan Kepala Desa.	<i>Balerong</i> <sup>21</sup> <sup>21</sup> <b>Office of the village head.</b>	Transference. Paraphrase, and Reduction
12	<i>Nambo</i> <sup>73</sup> <sup>73</sup> Kakek. Kata ini umum digunakan <b>masyarakat</b> sekitar Danau Maninjau.	<i>Nambo</i> <sup>24</sup> <sup>24</sup> Grandfather. This word is generally used in <b>communities</b> around Lake Maninjau.	Transference, Literal Translation, and Shift or Transposition
13	<i>Man thalabal ula sahiral layati</i> <sup>74</sup> <sup>74</sup> Siapa yang ingin mendapatkan kemuliaan akan bekerja <b>sampai jauh malam</b>	<i>Man thalabal ula sahiral layati</i> <sup>25</sup> <sup>25</sup> <b>He</b> who wants to obtain nobility, will work late <b>into the night</b> .	Transference, Expansion, and Modulation

14	<i>Anak daro</i> <sup>75</sup> <sup>75</sup> Sebutan untuk mempelai perempuan dalam <b>acara</b> perkawinan <b>di Minang</b>	<i>Anak daro</i> <sup>26</sup> <sup>26</sup> The name for the bride in Minang <b>weddings.</b>	Transference, Shift or Transposition, and Reduction
15	<i>Tajammu</i> <sup>76</sup> <sup>76</sup> Bahasa slang Arab ala MP: berkumpul bersama <b>sambil</b> makan	<i>Tajammu</i> <sup>27</sup> <sup>27</sup> Arabic slang ala MP: gather together <b>and</b> eat.	Transference, Literal Translation and Shift or Transposition

Data (1) consisting of an Arabic sentence gives information about daily conversation used at school like in a speaking class pointing to an object, a book which is close to the speaker and it is indicated by the use of article *hazaa* 'this'. The sentence footnoted is a simple sentence. The translation procedures identified are triplets, where three procedures are used altogether. The first translation procedure, like in most cases of translating footnotes, is transference, where the whole sentence in Arabic is transferred exactly the same as a loan, *Haaza kitaabun*. The second procedure is literal translation. It deals with a simple sentence in the source language, *Ini 'this' buku 'book' (Arab)*, having the same major syntactic structure as the target language, **this is a book**. As the syntactic structure is the same only in the major part and the minor part is different, this involves more procedure, namely expansion, to make the translation acceptable in the target language. The expansion is needed to add to be, **is**, due to the grammar rule in the target language that a verb is a must and an indefinite article, **a**, is also a must to be put before singular noun, **book**. The same case occurs in data (7) which contains information about the daily conversation in Arabic, a polite imperative or invitation *tafadhal 'silakan'* equals to **'please'** as a verb. As data (7) deals with the same combination of translation procedures, the analysis regarding the use of procedures of the translation will not be discussed anymore.

The word or term or sentence footnoted in data (2) is an Arabic sentence containing information about a daily conversation at school. It is a question asking about the progress of the student's language skills in Arabic. The content of the footnotes, which is given in the Indonesian language, is made in simple sentence *Bagaimana bahasa Arab kamu?* 'How is your Arabic?'. However, it involves the use of noun phrase structure *bahasa Arab kamu*, which is not the same as the one in the target language. The possessive *kamu* 'your' is put after the noun *bahasa Arab* 'Arabic', while in the target language, possessive is put before a noun, **your Arabic**. It is, therefore, the translation of data (2) involves three translation procedures. The first procedure is transference as the sentence footnoted, which is in Arabic, is transferred exactly the same form as a loan *Kaifa Arabiyatuka ya akhi. Khalas, lancar?*. The second procedure is expansion as the target language sentence needs to be added with to be, **is**, as a verb. No English sentence goes without a verb. The last procedure used is shift or transposition as there is a change in the structure of noun phrases in the target text from noun plus possessive, *bahasa Inggris kamu* into a possessive plus noun, **your Arabic**. The same case occurs in data (12) and data (15). In data (12), the footnoted word or term is *Nambo*, a Minangkabau word. It is an address term in Minangkabau culture for *kakek* 'grandfather', more specifically used by Minangkabau people around Lake Maninjau. In data (15), the footnoted word or term is an Arabic word, *tajammu*. It is an Arabic slang used in Islamic Boarding School to refer to a condition where everybody gathers together so they can eat together. Due to the fact that the combination of translation procedures is the same with data (2), the two other data (12) and (15) are not going to be discussed anymore.

The content of footnotes in data (3) is the response of footnoted sentences in data (2). It contains the information about the student's answer of his progress in his Arabic language skill as part of daily conversation in an Islamic Boarding School in Indonesia. It is given in a casual way in one incomplete sentence without any explicit subject used, *Iya biasa aja 'yeah, okay', sudah bisa sedikit-sedikit 'can a little' (dalam grammar yang kurang tepat 'in incorrect grammar')*. The translation procedure used is triplets consisting of (i) transference as the whole parts of the sentences footnoted are transferred exactly the same as loan words *Aadi faqad. Sedikit-sedikit, astathi*. The second procedure is shift or transposition as one single sentence in the source text ***Iya biasa aja, sudah bisa sedikit-sedikit (dalam grammar yang kurang tepat)*** is translated into two sentences. **Yeah, it's OK. I can speak a little bit (using incorrect grammar)**. The third procedure is expansion, as the incomplete sentence in the source text is translated into a complete sentence with the addition of subject and verb **it's**, and **I can speak**. This same combination of procedures occurs in data (9), so the analysis about the use of translation procedures in data (9) will not be discussed anymore. What will be discussed here is the information given in the footnotes regarding the footnoted word there. In data (9), the footnoted word or term is the name of a famous world explorer, Ibnu Batutah from Morocco, who once travelled to Samudera Pasai, the kingdom off the coast of Sumatra.

The footnoted word or term or sentence in data (4) is an Arabic sentence. It contains information about daily conversation precisely thanking for coming to the place of the speaker. The whole sentence is transferred to the target text exactly the same without any changes at all, as in a case of a loan, *Syukron ya ikhwani lihudurikum*. It, therefore, involves transference as in almost all data of footnotes. The second procedure is a literal translation due to the fact that the content of the footnoted sentence is a simple sentence of thanking with basic structure *Terima kasih untuk kedatangan kalian* 'thank you for your coming' which both source language and the target language have so the literal translation is possible. However, the equivalent is without the explicit

possessive *kalian* 'your' in plural dealing with their coming. In that case, it involves another procedure, namely reduction, so the equivalent in the target language is **thank you for coming** and not **thank you for your coming** that supposed to be.

Data (5) contains the information about acronyms in the Indonesian language regarding the sender in letter/mail correspondence. The acronym *sip* stands for *si pengirim*, 'the sender' is written at the back of an envelope before the name of the sender. As all data in Table 4 use, three procedures of translation altogether, namely triplets, data (5) also involves three procedures: (i) transference as the word *sip* is transferred exactly the same; reduction as the phrase *di korespondensi surat* 'in letter/mail correspondence' is deleted instead of translated; (iii) shift or transposition as the information in the footnotes in the source text consists of two sentences *Sip adalah kependekan dari si pengirim. Sering dipakai di korespondensi surat waktu itu* while in the target text it is shifted into one sentence **Sip is an abbreviation for from the sender, often used at that time**. The same translation procedures also occur in data (6) and data (14). The footnoted word, term, or sentence in data (6) is Minangkabau food, *randang kariang jo kantang* 'dried *randang* with potatoes'. It gives information about Minangkabau food called *randang*, specifically the one made dried with small potatoes in it. As it is heated frequently and becomes dry, it can last for a very long time. Meanwhile, in data (14), the footnoted word or term is a Minangkabau term, *anak daro* 'the bride'. It gives information that the bride in Minangkabau culture is called *anak daro*.

In data (7), the footnoted word or term or sentence is an Arabic sentence. It contains information about the daily conversation, polite way to give a chance to someone to do something or inviting to do something like having meals. The footnotes involve three translation procedures used altogether for one datum to be translated: (i) transference as the sentence *Tafadhhal* in Arabic is translated into *Tafadhhal*, exactly the same spelling as a loan; (ii) literal translation as it is translated into the same form *silakan* into **please** as a polite imperative; (iii) expansion as after translating into the same form then it is added by information between brackets (Arabic).

The footnotes in data (8) deals with Arabic words in a sentence, *Kulukum ra'in wakullukum masulun an raiyatih*. It contains information about teaching in Islamic Boarding School that discusses the concept of a leader. The Arabic sentence is transferred exactly the same into the target text, so it involves transference. The next translation procedure is expansion as an English sentence always needs a verb that in the context it is to be, **is**, and the addition is also needed for a singular noun, **leader**, as an indefinite article, **a**. The third procedure in the combination is called modulation. There is a change in viewpoint that the passive sentence *apa yang dipimpinya* 'what is conducted' is shifted into active **what they lead**. The same combination of translation also occurs in data (13) *Man thalabal ula sahiral layali*, an Arabic sentence. It contains information about Islamic teaching *Siapa yang ingin mendapatkan kemuliaan akan bekerja sampai jauh malam* 'who wants to get a nobility needs to work harder. He/she needs to work until late at night'. The analysis about the use of translation procedures in data (13) is not going to be discussed anymore.

In data (10), the footnoted word or term is an Arabic word. It is a term, *Ghosab*, used in Islamic Boarding School to refer to a condition where one is not allowed to use anyone slippers without their permission. It is one of the strict rules which cannot be ignored as it will lead to a case of violation like stealing, and any student who does this could be sent home for good. Unlike any other data, data (10) is unique as it does not involve transference. The footnoted word *Ghosab* in the source text does not appear in the footnotes in the target text. The translator uses the main information as a footnoted sentence in a modulation; **I hadn't used anyone slippers without their permission**. The general information in *Menggunakan atau mengambil sandal orang lain tanpa izin* as the main information refers to the term *ghasab* is intended to all, but in the target text, it is specified only for one person, I. The second procedure is shift or transposition as the sentence *PM sangat ketat dalam disiplin penggunaan hak orang lain*, which consists of one clause is translated into two clauses: **MP's rule was very strict in discipline when it came to the rights of others**. The shift or transposition is also for the translation of a phrase *penggunaan hak orang lain* into a clause when it comes to the rights of others. Then there is one more procedure involved in this data (10), namely expansion, as there is additional information **this kind of violation** which is not there in the source text which functions as a subject in the second sentence.

The footnotes in data (11) involve the use of Minangkabau word, *Balerong*. The information contained in the word is a name of an office building used by the village head in Minangkabau communities in villages. The translation of the footnotes involves three translation procedures, namely triplets. The first procedure is transference as the word *balerong* is taken as a loan word; it is transferred exactly the same spelling. Then the second procedure is paraphrase as the detailed information: *Kantor Wali Nagari. Fungsinya hampir sama dengan Kepala Desa* is made simple into **office of the village head** taken from two important words: *kantor* 'office' and *Kepala Desa* 'Village Head'. The rest of information *Wali Nagari adalah jabatan khas di kampung-kampung Minangkabau* 'Wali Nagari is specific position in kampongs in Minangkabau is deleted. It, therefore, involves the translation procedure, namely reduction.

The footnoted term in data (12), *nambo*, is a Minangkabau word that functions as an address term for grandfather in Minangkabau culture. From the data, it can be identified that there are three translation procedures used all together, namely triplets: the first one is transference as the Minangkabau word is transferred to the target text exactly the same as a loan word or borrowing; the second translation procedure is literal translation as the information given in the footnotes of the source text is translated exactly



the same major syntactic structure, S V Adv Adv of place; the third procedure is shifts or transpositions as the structure of noun phrase in Indonesian, and English is different, the definite article **this** is put before noun **word** in English, **this word** 'ini kata' while in Indonesian it is put after the noun, *kata ini*; then there is one other case of shift or transposition from singular, *masyarakat* 'community' into plural **communities**.

Table 5. Translating Footnotes Using Quadruplets

No.	Footnotes in the Source Text	Footnotes in the Target Text	Translation Procedures
1	<i>Amak</i> <sup>1</sup> <b>Panggilan</b> untuk Ibu di sebagian besar daerah di Minang	<i>Amak</i> <sup>1</sup> <b>A word</b> for mother in most <b>Minang areas</b> .	Transference, Expansion, Modulation, and Shift or Transposition
2	<i>Silek tuo</i> <sup>52</sup> <sup>52</sup> <i>Silek tuo</i> ini adalah ibu segala silat di Minangkabau. <b>Gerakannya</b> efisien dan minimalis tapi hasil maksimal. <b>Diajarkan di kampung-kampung di Minang melalui guru silat di sasaran, atau tempat latihan.</b>	<i>Silek tuo</i> <sup>13</sup> <sup>13</sup> <i>Silek tuo</i> is the mother of all <b>silat martial arts</b> in Minangkabau. <b>The movements</b> are efficient and minimalist <b>with</b> maximum results.	Transference, Expansion, Shifts or Transpositions, and Reduction

The word which is footnoted in data (1) in table 5 is a Minang word, *Amak* 'Mom', an address term for mother in Minangkabau culture. The translation of data (1) involves four translation procedures altogether: the first translation procedure is transference for the same reason as other reasons given in the previous data that the word *Amak* is translated into *Amak* again as a loan word; the second translation procedure is expansion as there is an addition of an article **a** before the noun **word** showing singularity; the third translation procedure is modulation as there is a change in viewpoint where the word *panggilan* 'term' having a specific meaning to call someone is translated into **word** having a general meaning which covers all terms; and the last translation procedure is shift or transposition where two prepositional phrases *di sebagian besar daerah* 'in most areas' and *di Minang* 'in Minang' are translated into one prepositional phrase, **in most Minang areas**.

In data (2), the term *Silek Tuo* 'Old Silat' is a Minangkabau word that refers to traditional martial arts silat, which originated from Minangkabau culture. The content of information given in the footnotes in the target text cannot be classified as descriptive equivalent as the description has already been given in the source text. The translator just translates it in the form of the content, but from her translation work regarding the content of the information, it can be identified that there are four translation procedures combined together, namely quadruplets which are involved:

- (1) Transference as it transfers the words *Silek Tuo* exactly like that, no changes at all.
- (2) Expansion as the translator adds the term **martial arts** after the word *silat*.
- (3) Shifts or Transpositions as the single word *gerakannya* 'its movement' is translated into a phrase, a noun phrase, **the movements** and the singular word *gerakan* 'movement' is translated into plural **movements**, then coordinative conjunction *tapi* 'but' is translated into preposition **with**.
- (4) Reduction as the last sentence in the source text is deleted.

### 5. Conclusion

There are some interesting phenomena that can be put as a conclusion in the case of translating footnotes into footnotes again, which is reflected in this research.

- (a) Translating footnotes deals with the use of transference. This is one of the phenomena about footnotes that footnotes mostly involve transference as it needs to keep the identity of a word or term or sentence which is footnoted.
- (b) Translating footnotes can never use one single procedure of translation. It needs a combination of several procedures, two (couplets), three (triplets), or four (quadruplets).
- (c) Translating from footnotes into footnotes will never involve the following procedures, especially: descriptive equivalent, functional equivalent, cultural equivalent as the effort by a translator in translating footnotes, not making the three of them. Making the three kinds of equivalents has already been carried out by an author of the source text. A translator just needs to translate the information already given in the source text.
- (d) The information given by a translator in her own footnotes, not as the equivalent is more various as it deals with (i) Indonesian acronym like *angkot* stands for *angkutan kota* 'public transportation in Indonesia using minibus; (ii) Indonesian address term *kak* which is a polite way to call an older person usually in a family as a sibling for brother and sister ; (iii) Indonesian traditional way of watching movies together with a very wide screen install in the field, *layar tancap* ; (iv) Indonesian Muslim scholar, Buya Hamka, and Indonesian leader, BJ Habibie.

**Funding:** This research received no external funding. All expenses were paid by the authors.

**Conflicts of Interest:** The authors declare no conflict of interest.

## References

- [1] Buansari, I., Supriatno, A., & Pangestu, M. (2020). Translation Procedure Used In Translating Banking Term in Legal Documents of BCA. *Wanastra: Jurnal Bahasa Dan Sastra*, 12(2), 247–258. <https://doi.org/10.31294/w.v12i2.8427>
- [2] Carolia, D. (2019). Translation Procedures in Translating Abstracts of Postgraduate Students of Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University. *Journal of English Language Teaching and Cultural Studies*, 2(1), 25–38. <https://doi.org/10.48181/jelts.v2i1.7744>
- [3] Erlina. (2016). *Translation Studies: Basic Guidelines for Students of Translation Major*. Sastra Unpad Press & CV Semiotika.
- [4] Gahan, C. (2018). How and When to Use Footnotes | Including Word Instructions. *How to Use Footnotes and Endnotes*, 1, 2021–2022. <https://www.scribbr.com/citing-sources/what-are-footnotes-and-endnotes/>
- [5] George, M. (2008). *Elements of Library Research*. Princeton University Press.
- [6] Haroon, H. (2019). The use of footnotes in the Malay translation of A Thousand Splendid Suns. *Translation and Interpreting*, 11(1), 130–146. <https://doi.org/10.12807/ti.111201.2019.a08>
- [7] Hartono, R. (2014). *Model Penerjemahan Novel Dari Bahasa Inggris ke Bahasa Indonesia*. Diandra Pustaka Indonesia.
- [8] Hermawan, H., & Tanjung, S. (2018). A Bahasa Indonesia-English translation analysis of Negeri Lima Menara and The Land of Five Towers. *LingTera*, 5(1), 19–31. <https://doi.org/10.21831/lt.v5i1.8065>
- [9] Kothari, C. R. (2004). *Research Methodology\_ Methods and Techniques*. New Age International Publishers.
- [10] Mahmud, E. Z. (2021). PROSEDUR PENERJEMAHAN KUPLET PADA TERJEMAHAN NAMA-NAMA KULINER INDONESIA. *Jurnal Penerjemahan*, 8(1), 36–57.
- [11] Mahmud, E. Z. (2018). *Strategies in Translating Minangkabau Cultural Words in the Land of Five Towers "Negeri Lima Menara", Fuadi's Novel*. 166(Prasasti), 476–482. <https://doi.org/10.2991/prasasti-18.2018.87>
- [12] Mahmud, E. Z., Ampera, T., & Bayusena, B. (2021). Paraphrase Strategy in Translating Indonesian Novel into English. *International Journal of Social Science and Human Research*, 04(01). <https://doi.org/10.47191/ijsshr/v4-i1-17>
- [13] Molina, L., & Albir, A. H. (2002). Translation techniques revisited: A dynamic and functionalist approach. *Meta*, 47(4), 498–512. <https://doi.org/10.7202/008033ar>
- [14] Newmark, P. (1988). A Textbook of Translation. In *Shanghai Foreign Language Education Press*. Pearson Education Limited.
- [15] Nida. (1982). *HELPS FOR TRANSLATORS THE THEORY AND PRACTICE OF TRANSLATION PUBLISHED FOR THE UNITED BIBLE SOCIETIES*. E.J. Brill.
- [16] Rahayu, E. M. (2021). *ANALYZING THE TRANSLATION OF INDONESIAN CULTURAL TERMS IN THE NOVEL ' TARIAN BUMI ' TRANSLATED INTO ' EARTH DANCE . ' 7(2)*, 150–161.
- [17] Torres, P. (2013). *Literary Translation*. Colegio Nacional De Licenciados En Traducccion E Interpretacion. <https://conalti.org/en/>
- [18] Zulkifli-Mahmud, E., Bayusena, B., & Erika M, R. (2020). The Existence of Arabic Language in Indonesian Source Text and English Target Text. *Humanities & Social Sciences Reviews*, 8(3), 990–1003. <https://doi.org/10.18510/hssr.2020.83102>