

Original Research Article

A Comparative Study of Two Translations of Manto's Short Story "Toba Tek Singh"

Saddiqa Ahsan

Graduate Researcher (BS Hons), Department of English, Government Sadiq College Women University Bahawalpur, Pakistan

Corresponding Author: Saddiqa Ahsan, E-mail: ahmadchaudary13@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Article History

Received: March 21, 2020

Accepted: April 16, 2020

Volume: 2

Issue: 1

KEYWORDS

Translation, Taseer, Hassan, Bakee

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study is to analyze the translation of Manto's short story "Toba Tek Singh" by Khalid Hassan and Aatish Taseer. The study through qualitative method of research analysis the works related to this study. The study discusses the techniques of translation like Adaptation, Free translation and Imitation with the help of Mona Baker's theory from the book "Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies" which is applied to these two translations. The study shows how Hassan omitted some real words, phrases and sentences of the source language and he added some new words, phrases and sentences into the translation. It also shows how Taseer maintains the beauty of the original text. It is concluded that the translation of Taseer is clear and regarded as the best translation as compared to Hassan. Taseer has a good command over the translation and he also used effective strategies of translation than Hassan.

Introduction

The term "Translation Studies" was coined by an American scholar James S. Holmes in his paper "The Name and Nature of Translation Studies" in 1972. Translation is the system of transferring message from one language to another language. Translation is the cultural activity where the cultural phenomenon is generally associated with translating one textual content into another. It is multidimensional and versatile in its nature. Translation method is a difficult task for the translators to hold the equivalence between source language (SL) and target language text. Translator's job is to provide justice to each of the texts because language and culture are connected with one another.

Translation is necessary for the development of information, knowledge, and ideas. It makes the communication more effective from all over the world. Translation is also a medium through which people understand the language and culture of other people or countries. Translation also plays a major role in the advancement of society. The main aim of translation is to find the identical meaning of the source language in the target language. The meaning is very important in translation like how translators translate the original text into another language so it is important to note that its original meaning remain constant. Because when original meaning is changed then the sense of the original text is also changed. It seems that the translators create a new text into another language. Translation means to supply the meaning of original text into another language. The message that is present in source language is translated into target language such as Catford states (1965, p.20) that translation may be defined as "the replacement of textual material in one language (SL) by equivalent textual material in another language (TL)". Language and translation are interconnected. Translation cannot be original.

There are different types of translations and also different theories and strategies are used during translation process as catford believes that "any theory of translation must draw upon a theory of language" (1965, p.1). At some point translators leave the wording of the author and tries to move the readers toward their own language and culture and they also ignore the culture of the author and use their own culture during translation. Translation means to reproduce the meaning of one language into another language that is close to the source language and also conveys meaning that are

appropriate and considered as best in terms of its style and structure as well.

There are thousands of languages all around the world that we use to speak or to share our ideas, thoughts and feelings with other people. All these languages have their own grammar, vocabulary, structures, style and features. Translation is an important tool to exchange the message from one language to another language. Translators are from different regions and cultures and they use different languages. So, in translation process they use the language of that region and also present a culture from which they belong that is different from the author's language and culture.

During translation translators replace the original text into their own language or sometimes in a language that is difficult for the readers to understand as Newmark (1981) defines translation as "a craft consisting in the attempt to replace a written message and or statement in one language by the same message and/or statement in another language". It is clear from Newmark's definition that translation means to replace the message of the author into another language that is easier for the translators and they also present the original message in a more suitable manner.

Statement of the Problem

Sadat Hassan Manto's short story "Toba Tek Singh" has been translated into many languages. The English translation of Aatish Taseer is good and effective as compared to Khalid Hassan's because he understands the culture of Manto and presents it in a more befitting manner.

Objectives of the Study

The objectives of this research are as follows:

- 1) To explore that Aatish Taseer has dealt with cultural words, phrases and paragraphs in a way that they convey the sense as that of original text.
- 2) To find out that how Khalid Hassan has distorted the sense of the original text of Manto in terms of cultural words, phrases, paragraphs etc.

Research Questions

The research questions of this thesis are as follows:

- 3) How is translation of Aatish Taseer good and effective?
- 4) What are the flaws in the translation of Khalid Hassan?

Scope of the Study

This research will analyze the translations of short story "Toba Tek Singh". These two translations are compared at different levels to see how much justice both translators have done with translation. Most of the previous researches on "Toba Tek Singh" are based on its themes or the writing style of Manto, in general. This study is limited to the analysis of the translation of "Toba Tek Singh" by Khalid Hassan and Aatish Taseer.

Purpose of the Study

This research is meant to provide knowledge about the techniques used by translators during the translation of "Toba Tek Singh" and also see whose translation is more effective, precise and appropriate and set a best example in the history of translation. This research will be useful for the readers who want to widen their knowledge and interpretation about the translations of Manto's short story "Toba Tek Sing".

Delimitation of the Study

This research is limited to only one short-story of Manto i.e. "Toba Tek Singh" and its two translations.

The two translators compared in this research are Aatish Taseer and Khalid Hassan.

Literature Review

This research focuses on comparative analysis of two translations of Manto's short story "Toba Tek Singh" with the help of Mona Baker's theory. This section is based on review of the literature, researcher has done before starting her research and how it has facilitated her in her own research. It helps the researcher to explore the agreements, disagreements and gaps of this research.

"Toba Tek Singh" in English: An assessment of Khalid Hassan translation" by Navdeep Kaur states that translation can be defined as the transferring of already available material from source language to target language. Sadat Hassan Manto's Urdu short stories have been translated into different languages. His short story "Toba Tek Singh" has been translated from Urdu to English by many translators. This research explores the authenticity of these translations and also examine how Hassan's translation raises some important issues about the objectives of a translator. Khalid Hassan replace the original text and he also presents an untrue version of Manto to English readers (Kaur, 2015, p.26). This paper is helpful for the researcher to understand the issues rising during the process of translation and also increase knowledge that how Khalid Hassan distorted the original text.

"The comparative study of various translations of Manto's short story "Toba Tek Singh" by Muhammad Usman Khan analyzed the short story "Toba Tek Singh" comparatively with the help of Larson's meaning based translation theory. The relationship between source language (SL) and target language (TL) was judged. The four translators were compared on the basis of their works. Sometimes misinterpretation created during the process of translation. It was because the meaning of the source language was changed. During the process of translation source language and target language are different in terms of its meaning, form, style, and structure. There is no equivalence of the source language into the target language. It was found that no translator did a good job and there were some shortcomings in every translation like some words and phrases were omitted and added into translation. In this paper among all the four writers the "Anonymous translator" was considered as best translation (Khan, 2014, p.272). This research paper gives information about the techniques of omission and addition used by these four particular translators and also develop understanding about Larson's meaning based translation theory.

"Transparency or Transference? The case of Manto's "Toba Tek Singh" by Ayesha Abrar explores that Sadat Hassan Manto is considered as the greatest short story writer. His best known story "Toba Tek Singh" is considered as a masterpiece. It was translated into English by many scholars and authors to render its clarity into English. It is not to explore the best or closest translation but to study what is lost and gained in the process of translation. There is a great deal of difference of transferring a text from one language to another and it will also reveal the literary and sociological relevance. This paper employs three different translations of Manto's short story "Toba Tek Singh". These three translations are by Khalid Hassan, Prof. M. Asaduddin and by Robert B. Haldane. It will not attempt to determine the translations that are the most closest one to the original text but it study the comparison with the original text and with other translations. Translation is an interaction between a source language text and a target language text. It is also described by Itamar Even-Zohar. He proposes "translation theory". He calls translation a 'de- composition' of a text in one language followed by a 're-composition' of the same text in another language. It will also study the nuances of each translation (Abrar, 2015, p.409). From this paper, the researcher noticed that translation cannot be original. There is a great difference of transferring a source language (SL) text into target language (TL) text.

"Language, Translation and Culture" by Gelavizh Abbasi, Saman Saleh Zadeh, Elenaz Janfaza, Arezoo Assemi and Siamak Sadat Dehgan explores that language is a phenomenon that links different cultures and it is also a way through which people can express their thoughts and feelings. It also analyses the role of translation in the transferring of cultural concepts from one language to another and also the difficulties faced by translators during this process. A good translator should be aware of the cultural, historical, traditional and religious background of the source text. They have also discussed the translation barriers through transferring cultures among languages. They also define that translation has an important role in globalization of cultures especially pop culture leading to expand ethnic habits and customs or religious values. Both language and culture are important for each other and every region has its own cultural features. Translators should not only concentrate on the same meaning but also show dissimilarities between the two cultures. (Abbasi et al, 2012, p.83) This paper helps the researcher to understand the relationship between language and culture. It also gives information about the role of translation in the transformation of cultural words from source language to target language.

"Changes of Translation Definition and Turns of Translation Studies" by Long Jixing explores that since the twentieth century translation studies has made great progress. The study of translation has taken turns. It discusses the turns of translation studies and the disputes that arises between linguistic, cultural, social and psychological paradigm. There is a relationship between the changing definitions of translation and the turns of translation studies and both are connected with one another. It is found that the war between the definitions of translations has made a huge impact on the turns of translation studies. Due to the broadening of definitions and shifting of turns, the scope of translation studies is also expanding (Jixing, 2012, p.42). This paper helps the researcher to understand the relationship between the definitions and turns of translation

because the turns in the definitions of translation generates new definitions and in this way the process is going on.

“A Research Proposal on the Problem of Equivalence in Translation” by Datta G. Sawant examines that translation studies have recently developed as a separate branch of study. In the earlier days, translation was considered as a secondary writing but since 1980s it has been developing and assuming the status of a special branch of knowledge. This paper attempts to examine the new trends in translation studies and also the problem of equivalence in translation especially from English language to Marathi. The three English novels which are translated into Marathi are taken into consideration. Those three novels are i.e. Arvind Adiga’s “The white Tiger”, Dan Brown’s “The Davinci Code” and Paulo Coelho’s “The Alchemist”. It is necessary to study the role of equivalences. The process of translation depends on different types of equivalences such as linguistics, semantic, stylistic, social, cultural, mythical and symbolic equivalences. (Sawant, 2012, p.1). This paper gives information about the problem of equivalences in the translation process and also the different types of equivalences.

“Translation procedures, strategies and methods” by Mahmoud ordudari explores that translation means to transfer source language (SL) text into target language (TL) texts. The purpose of translation is to reproduce different kinds of texts into another language such as religious, literary, scientific and philosophical texts and also making them available to all readers. The most problematic factors that are involved in translation are its form, meaning, style, proverbs, idioms etc .Translating culture-specific concepts (CScs) and allusions are the most challenging tasks for the translators. There are some procedures and strategies for furnishing of CScs and allusions. This paper also explores the similarities that exist between these procedures and strategies and also analyzes the procedure or strategy which are more productive. Translation strategies and procedures are essential parts of the translation process. It could be beneficial for the foreign language readers as much as for the source language readers. This paper makes the understanding of the researcher clear about those strategies which are more effective and create a better impression for the readers of the target language (Ordudari, 2007).

“Translation studies: An introduction to the history and development of (Audiovisual) translation” by Bettem Soler Pardo briefly describes the history of translation and the birth of translation studies. It also introduces the polysystem theory and the concepts of norms proposed by Gideon Toury. There are five approaches of the translation studies but its main focus is on the communicative and socio-cultural approach. It also presents the model of audiovisual translation. This research paper gives information about different approaches that are used in the field of translation and also develop understanding about audiovisual translation (Pardo, 2013).

“Translation Techniques used in translating cultural words of PALPASA CAFÉ” by Puspa Niroula examine those techniques that are employed in the translation of cultural terms of the novel “Palpasa Cafe”. It also points out the difficulties created during this process. There are four categorizes of these cultural terms such as ecology, material, culture, social-culture and religious culture. Among all the techniques of translation the literal translation and paraphrasing/definition techniques are considered as the best and most useful techniques for the translation of cultural terms. This research paper gives information about the translation of cultural words from source language to target language and also increase knowledge about those techniques that are most widely used for the translation of cultural words (Niroula, 2017, p.17).

“Problems and strategies in English Translation of Quranic Divine Names” by Fazel Asadi Amjad explores that more than eighty percent of the population of Muslims do not know Arabic and they use translations to understand the meaning and also the message of the Holy Quran. The three translators are compared in this research. These three translators are Shakir (1985), Qarai (2003), and Nikayin (2006). They provide their translations in the form of prose, poetry and also phrase- by-phrase translation. This paper also explores those problems faced by translators for the attaining of lexical and semantic equivalence. It will also describe the types and strategies used by these three translators. It was found that most frequent strategies acquired by Shakir and Qarai were “near- synonymy” and “expansion”. However, Nikayin used these two strategies to an equal extent as his most repeated strategies (Amjad, 2013, p.128). This research paper gives information about the translations of Quranic Divine Names (DNs) and also develop understanding about the different forms of translation.

“Corpus- Based Approaches to Translation Studies” by SHEN Guo-rong examines that corpus- based translation studies have extended in the beginning of the 1990s. It also describes the design and application of translation English corpus. There are different types and procedures of corpus used in translation studies. Mona Baker is considered as the first scholar who apply corpus to explain translation phenomenon in the middle of 1990s. According to Baker there are three kinds of corpora such as parallel corpora, comparable corpora and multilingual corpora. Among these three kinds of corpus, the two are widely used. They play a positive role in the studies of source and target texts and testing out the hypothesis in an explicit and

empirical way (Guo-rong, 2010, p.182). This research paper helps to understand the types and procedures used in corpus-based translation studies and also gives information about those kinds of corpus which was proposed by Mona Baker.

"Techniques for Translating cultural words in English to Indonesian subtitles of Frozen" by Yuni Astuti Dewi Wulandari explores that translation plays an important role in many sectors of life such as education, entertainment, economy etc. Mostly people find difficulty while comprehending the content of the English film so, film translation is also needed. It will also describe the techniques of translation used by subtitler in translation of cultural words from English to Indonesian language. It is necessary for the subtitler to create an effective translation and also develop good understanding about the politeness of both source language and target language. Two theories are used for the translation of cultural words. One is "cultural words" theory by Newmark and second is "The translator's invisibility" theory by Lawrence Venuti. There are different tendencies used for the translation of cultural words such as domestication, foreignization, partial foreignization and partial domestication. Domestication is a strategy in which a transparent and fluent style is adopted in order to minimize the peculiarity of the foreign text for target language readers. Foreignization designates the type of translation in which a target text breaks target conventions by retaining something foreign of the original (Wulandari, 2016, p.2). This research paper gives information about the translation of film and also helps to understand the theories of the translation of cultural words.

"Equivalence in Translation Theories: A critical Evaluation" by Despoina Panou. The concept of translation holds a central position in translation studies. This paper critically evaluates the theories of equivalence proposed by different scholars such as Vinay and Darbelnet (1958) , Jakobson (1959) , Nida and Taber (1969) , Catford (1965) , House (1997) ,Koller (1979) , Newmark (1981) ,Baker (1992) and Pym (2010). All these theories provide better understanding about the concept of equivalence in translation studies. Many translation theories are based on two opposing ways of translation such as Nida and Taber differentiate between formal and dynamic equivalence, Newmark distinguish between semantic and communicative translation, Catford between formal and textual equivalence, House between overt and covert translation and Pym differentiate between natural and directional equivalence. Equivalence is very important in translation studies. It is a main problem translator faced during the process of translation (Panou, 2013, p.5). This research paper helps to understand the concept of equivalence in translation studies and also the different theories of equivalence

"A Review of the History of Translation Studies" by Ali Reza Ghanoooni explores that there are some changes taking place in the history of translation. All these changes differ from one place to another place. The two most important pioneers of this field are Horace and Cicero (first century B.C) whose discussions of translation practice is related to word-for-word and sense-for-sense translation. It will also describe the history of translation studies and also the approaches that have been developed during the twentieth century. Translation studies is divided into two main branches "pure" and 'applied". Translation studies now become a field which brings all the approaches from language and cultural studies together, modifies them and develop new models that are specific to its requirements (Ghanoooni, 2012, p.84). From this paper, the researcher understands about the history of translation studies and also increase knowledge about word for word and sense for sense translation.

"Research on Tourism English Translation Based on Cultural Differences" by Shi-Rong CUI explores that foreign tourism is a type of cross-cultural communicative activity. Tourism English translation involves all those aspects of cultural differences that are present in China and Western countries. The purpose of tourism English translation is to let those tourists whose mother tongue is English can read and understand the nature, culture and geography of other countries. It also analyzes those factors that affect the tourism English translation. It also describes those ideas that improve the accuracy of English translation in travel information and also make the tourists to have better understanding about the world (CUI, 2016). This paper gives information about the tourism English translation and also develop understanding that how tourists understand the cultures of different countries.

"The Equivalence and the shift of Meaning in the Translation of Indonesian into English in the cover stories of Tempo Magazines" by Yulia Arfanti explores that translation plays an important role in our everyday life. Translation is found in many books, magazines and newspapers. There are many translators who do their jobs in translating the source language text into the target language text. The role of translator is very important because he has to understand the source language so that he can translate it properly into the target language. It also examines the translation which is found in Tempo Magazine (Indonesian edition) and Tempo Magazine (English edition). It also uses the theories of Mona Baker and Catford for the equivalencies and shift of meaning (Arfanti, p.1). From this paper, the researcher analyzed the equivalence and shift

of meaning in the process of translation and also develop understanding about the theories proposed by Mona Baker and Catford.

“Research on the Cultural Equivalence in translation” by Siyu zou. Translation is a difficult task because language reflects culture. It carries the rich cultural ideas and it is also influenced by cultural limitations. Every country and nation have their own cultural factors. This paper attempts to explore the function of cultural factors in translation. It also describes the characteristics of culture and the role of culture in the process of translation. It also analyzes the reasons for the distortion of cultural images in translation and how to deal with cultural barriers. Some difficulties arise in the process of translation due to cultural characteristics. (Zou, 2016, p.1026). This paper gives information about the equivalence of culture in the process of translation and also increase knowledge about the characteristics of culture.

Previous studies focused on translation in general. Either they were focusing on translation equivalence, or on the definitions of translation or they used different theories and strategies of translation. This study focuses on the translations of Manto’s short story “Toba Tek Singh”. The two translators Khalid Hassan and Aatish Taseer are compared. It examines the techniques used by these two translators’ during the translation of “Toba Tek Singh”. These techniques were explored with the help of Mona Baker’s theory.

Theoretical Framework

Theoretical framework of this research is based on the strategies employed by Mona Baker in her book “*Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies*”. Each section dealt in this thesis such as cultural words, missing and addition of words, phrases and sentences etc has different strategies of doing and analyzing translation.

Different strategies are used in this research like adaptation, free translation and imitation. “Adaptation may be understood as a set of translative operations which result in a text that is not accepted as a translation but is nevertheless recognized as representing a source text of about the same length. As such the term may embrace numerous vague notions such as imitation, rewriting and so on. Strictly speaking, the concept of adaptation requires recognition of translation as non-adaptation, as a somehow more constrained mode of transfer” (Baker, 2005, p.5).

Adaptation specifically occurred when culture of one language is expressed in a different style that is familiar to another language culture. Basically, it is a shift in cultural environment. “Free translation in the history of Western translation theory is a kind of taxonomical shifter, taking a variety of different forms depending on what is opposed to it. Typically, what is opposed to it is faithful translation” (Baker, 2005, p.87). Free translation is based on the personal views of translators. It focuses on the content rather than the form of the target text. It means that the same content is expressed in the target text but with very different grammatical structures. According to Mona Baker “imitation means slavish copying, mimicking, miming. However, the word has come to mean the exact opposite in translation theory: doing something totally different from the original author, wandering too far and too freely from the words and sense of the SL text. Imitation has come to be virtually synonymous with free translation” (Baker, 2005. p.111). Imitation means to copy the words, expressions or actions of another person. It means to create something that is totally different from the original text.

Methodology

This part is comprised of the description of research methods used, and present a framework of research methodology. The researcher will discuss the study plan, source of primary and secondary information, data collecting and data analyzing techniques in this chapter.

Research Design

This research will be qualitative research and it will be using comparative and descriptive methods of research.

In comparative research two or more things are compared to understand the quality of things. In this research two translations of Manto’s short story “Toba Tek Singh” are compared. The two translators are Khalid Hassan and Aatish Taseer.

A descriptive research answers the questions how, why and what. In this research the following questions are answered i.e. how translators translate the original text? What are the flaws in their translations? Why the translation of Aatish Taseer is good and effective? Different written books, journals, literary criticism and documents are used to analyze the data.

Sources of Information

The primary sources of this research are "Toba Tek Singh" by Sadat Hassan Manto and the translations of "Toba Tek Singh" by Khalid Hassan and Aatish Taseer. The secondary source of this research is "*Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies*" by Mona Baker.

Data Collection Techniques

All the related data and helpful literary material is collected through a comprehensive reading of works by previous researchers, different journals, available literary criticism and related books and primarily by reading the translations of the story to get a better understanding. Supportive data related to the subject of the study is collected from all the available resources.

Data Analysis Technique

A detailed study of the translations of short story is taken and is analyzed with the relevance of the subject and then compared with other critics. After analyzing the data, a conclusion is drawn in the end of the study to give researcher's perspective.

Analysis of the Translation of Aatish Taseer in the Light of Mona Baker's Theory "Toba Tek Singh" is a short story written by Sadat Hassan Manto and it is translated by many translators from Urdu to English language. During the process of translation, translators change the form of original text, shorten the paragraphs, sentences or even missed the words and also translate the words into their own language which totally change the sense of original words and also replace cultural words with those words that are not effective.

Adaptation

In Aatish Taseer's translation, he has translated the cultural words from Urdu to English language but at some points he has changed the original meanings of Manto's culture and transferred into target language (TL). An American ethnologist Ward H. Goodenough defines culture as follows:

Culture consists of whatever it is one has to know or believe in order to operate in a manner acceptable to its members, and do so in any role that they accept for any of themselves. Culture, being what people have to learn as distinct from their biological heritage, must consist of the end product of learning: knowledge, in a most general, if relative, sense of the term. By this definition, we should note that culture is not a material phenomenon; it does not consist of things, people, behavior, or emotions. It is rather an organization of these things. It is the forms of things that people have in mind, their models for perceiving relating, and otherwise interpreting them (Goodenough 1964 in Nord, 1997, p.23-24).

The word "Jahroo" is translated as "broom" (Manto, 2016, p.64; Taseer, 2009, p.2). The word "Double rooti" is replaced by him as "toast" (Manto, 2016, p.65; Taseer, 2009, p.4). Newmark (1988, p.94) defines culture as "the way of life and its manifestation that are peculiar to a community that uses a particular language as its means of expression". Each community has its own language and culture and they use it to express their thoughts and feelings. The cultural word "Marondy" is translated as "sweets" (Manto, 2016, p.69; Taseer, 2009, p.8). Santoyo (1989, p.104) defines adaptation as a form of "naturalizing" the play for a new milieu, the aim being to achieve the same effect that the work originally had, but with an audience from a different cultural background". It is clear from Santoyo's definition that technique of adaptation is useful for the readers to understand a new culture. The word "Methyan" is also translated as "sweets" (Manto, 2016, p.68; Taseer, 2009, p.6). It's not a good choice of word because "sweets" has different meanings and at this point it seem someone visit another person he/she takes "Methiye" with him/her. It shows care and respect for each other and it also makes the relations stronger and more successful.

Free Translation

The following words are not translated by Aatish Taseer:

"Aur bilakhir aik din pagloon ky tabadaly ky liye mukarar hogy" is translated as "at last, a date for the transfer was scheduled". In this sentence the word "din" is replaced as "date" and "Pagloon ky" is missing here (Manto, 2016, p.62; Taseer, 2009, p.1). Free translation means to reproduce the meaning of the original text. It may or may not follow the form of the original text. "These dicta were called exhortations to free translation, that is to a looser, less slavish rendering of the

SL text, less bound to individual words and their sequencing” (Baker,2005,p.87)

“isi tarhan aik Sikh pagal ny aik dosrye Sikh pagal sy pocha” is translated as “similarly, one Sikh lunatic said to another” the word “Sikh Pagal” is not translated by him (Manto,2016, p.63;Taseer,2009, p.1).

Another sentence from original text “Bishen Singh ny is Khuda sy kahi martaba” is translated as “Bishen Singh implored him many times” the word “is khuda” is not translated by him (Manto, 2016, p.68; Taseer, 2009, p.7).

The sentence “dosryi ky kati hoi thee” is translated as “the other had too”. The word “kati” is missing here (Manto, 2016, p.69; Taseer, 2009, p.8).

In the last paragraph of the story the sentence for instance “idhar udhar sy kahi afsar dohrye aye aur dakha ky wo admi” is translated as “several officers came to see the man” the word “idhar udhar” is not translated by him (Manto, 2016, p.71; Taseer, 2009, p.10).

Additional Phrases

The following phrases are added by Aatish Taseer:

The sentence “wo Musلمان pagal jin ky lawahikeen Hindustan hi main thy” is translated as “It was decided in India that those Muslim Lunatic who had family living there”. “It was decided is added by Aatish Taseer(Manto, 2016, p.62; Taseer, 2016, p.1).

The sentence “aik M-S-C pass radio engineer main jo Musلمان tha” is translated as “In the daily routine of a radio engineer, a master of sciences” (Manto, 2016, p.64; Taseer, 2009, p.3).The phrase “in the daily routine” is added by him (Taseer, 2009, p.3). Riccardi (2002) defines translation as a “cross-cultural transmission of skills forms a bridge between two speech groups and is judged by the degree of gratification on/ acceptance among the audience of the target language”. Translation works as a bridge between two societies or two persons because through translation the knowledge of one person is transferred to another person.

The sentence “laitta be nhe tha” is translated as “not even laid down, for a single moment” (Manto, 2016, p.66; Taseer, 2009, p.4). The phrase “for a single moment” is added by the translator (Taseer, 2009, p.4).

“aur Fazal Din sy pocha” is translated as “then turning back to Fazal Din ,he asked”(Manto, 2016, p.69; Taseer, 2009, p.8).The phrase “ then turning back” is additional here(Taseer,2009,p.8).

Additional Words

Aatish Taseer added the following words:

The word “ustraye” is translated by him as “razor blades” the word “blades” is additional here.(Manto, 2016, p.63; Taseer, 2009, p.1).The word “razor” conveys complete meaning there is no need of the word “ blades”. “Translation adds value, bringing other creators and creations into being, in ways that reflect the mobility and multiplicity of our world” (Jose, 2015, p. 8). Translation has played a key role of communication between peoples from all over the world. It is necessary for translators to maintain the authenticity of translation.

The original sentence “aik din nahaty nahaty aik Musلمان pagal ny Pakistan Zindabad ka nara iss zoor sy buland kiya ky farash par phisal kr gira aur baihoosh ho gaya” is translated as “A Muslim lunatic, while bathing one morning, cried, Long Live Pakistan so loudly that he slipped and fell on the bathroom floor, knocking himself unconscious” (Manto, 2016, p.63; Taseer, 2009, p.2).In this sentence the word “bathroom” is additional (Taseer, 2009, p.2). “Jerome’s preferred form of free translation, rendering one sentence rather than one word at a time, is smuggled across the boundary between freedom and fidelity, brought into the camp of the faithful, as is befitting for a Christian translation ideal and leaving freedom, free translation, on the far side, outside the gates of true translation (Baker, 2005, p.88).

“aur is ny dosrye pagloon sy pochna shuru kiya ky Toba Tek Singh kahan hai” is translated as “and would regularly ask the other inmates if they knew where Toba Tek Singh” (Manto, 2016, p.67; Taseer, 2009, p.5). The word “regularly” and “they knew” is added by Taseer (Taseer, 2009, p.5).

The sentence “aur ye be kon seeny par hath rakh kar kaha sakta tha ky Hindustan aur Pakistan dono kisi din sirye sy gaib hi ho jayen” is translated as “and who could say with any conviction that one day both Pakistan and India would not be wiped

off the face of the earth" (Manto, 2016, p.66; Taseer, 2009, p.5). In this sentence the word "earth" is additional (Taseer, 2009, p.5).

"iska nama Bishen Singh tha" is translated as "though his name was really Bishen Singh" (Manto, 2016, p.67; Taseer, 2009, p.5). The word "really" is added by him (Taseer, 2009, p.5).

The sentence "Sikhon ky khuda hote tou zaroor meri sunte" is translated as "for if you were a sikh god, you would surely hear my appeal" (Manto, 2016, p.68; Taseer, 2009, p.7). In this sentence the word "appeal" is additional here (Taseer, 2009, p.7).

The sentence "aur.... mery laik jo khidmat hoo kehna main har waqat tyar hoon" is translated as "And....and if there's anything I can do, I'm always at their service" (Manto, 2016, p.69; Taseer, 2009, p.8). The word "and" is added by Taseer (Taseer, 2009, p.8).

Additional Sentences

The following sentences are added by Aatish Taseer:

The sentence "Hindustani barye shitani akar akar phirte hain" is translated as "Then, doing an impression of their arrogant ways he added, they strut about bolt upright like this" (Manto, 2016, p.63; Taseer, 2009, p.2). The sentence "then, doing an impression of their arrogant ways he added" is additional here (Taseer, 2009, p.2). Huang argues that "a good literary translation must reproduce something of the source text's style; otherwise the distinguishing literariness in the original will not be conveyed in the target text" (2011, p.4). The writing style of translator is very important in translation because without a good writing style translators can never be able to convey the original meaning to the audiences.

Another sentence i.e. "aik din nahate nahate aik Musلمان pagal ny" is translated as "In a separate section of the asylum, a Muslim lunatic, while bathing one morning" (Manto, 2016, p.63; Taseer, 2009, p.2). "In a separate section of the asylum" is added by him (Taseer, 2009, p.2).

"Toba Tek Singh Hindustan main chala gaya ha" is translated as "a great effort was made to convince him that Toba Tek Singh was now in India" (Manto, 2016, p.71; Taseer, 2009, p.9). The sentence "a great effort was made to convince him that" is additional here (Taseer, 2009, p.9).

Imitation

Aatish Taseer also imitated the words, phrases and sentences during the translation of source language (SL) text into target language (TL) text. Dryden argues that "imitation is not to translate the author's words, or to be confined to his sense, but only to set him as a pattern, and to write, as he supposes that author would have done, had he lived in our age, and in our country" (168, p.19). For example, in the first line of the story, the word "Ikhlai" is translated as "cordial" (Manto, 2016, p.62; Taseer, 2009, p.1).

The sentence from the original text "Hindustani barye shitani akar akar phirte hain" is translated as "they strut about bolt upright like this" (Manto, 2016, p.63; Taseer, 2009, p.2).

Another sentence from the original text "inki quftaqoo sy be wo koi nateja baramad nhe kr sakte thy" is translated as "they remained confused even after much discussion" (Manto, 2016, p.63; Taseer, 2009, p.2).

"agar wo Pakistan main hain tou ye kaisye ho sakta hai ky wo kuch arsa phly yehiyen rehty howye be Hindustan main thy" is translated as "And if Pakistan, how was it that they had ended up here, despite never having moved and having been in India only a short while ago" (Manto, 2016, p.64; Taseer, 2009, p.2).

"Imitation is the classical Latin translation of the Greek word mimesis, which was used in literary theory from Plato and Aristotle to describe the writer's imitation of reality, it was used for rewriting or respeaking classical texts and changing them in some significant way and also choosing some new words for saying the same thing. The two most common approaches to this was formulated by Quintilian in the late first century AD were "METAPHRASE", or changing one word at a time and "PARAPHRASE", or changing one phrase at a time" (Baker, 2005, p.111). For example, the phrase "leadron ko galiyan deta tha" is translated by him as "he hurled insults at all the leaders" (Manto, 2016, p.65; Taseer, 2009, p.3).

The original sentence "iski mehbooba Hindustani ban gaye aur wo Pakistani" is translated as "putting a border between him

and his beloved" (Manto, 2016, p.65; Taseer, 2009, p.4).

"pindalian be phool gaye theen magar is jasmani takleef ky bawajood lait kr aram nhe krta tha" is translated as "but despite his discomfort, he refused to lie down" (Manto, 2016, p.66; Taseer, 2009, p.4).

The sentence "uski aik larki thee jo har mahinye aik ungli barhti barhti" is translated as "he had one daughter, who adding an inch to her height every year" (Manto, 2016, p.67; Taseer, 2009, p.6).

"Fazal Din bukhla sa gaya" is translated as "Fazal Din gave a start" (Manto, 2016, p.69; Taseer, 2009, p.8).

The sentence from the original text "kahan phainka ja raha hai" is translated as "forced to go somewhere else" (Manto, 2016, p.70; Taseer, 2009, p.9).

Aatish Taseer's translation is more clear and precise. He has translated the sentences carefully. He has not changed the order of sentences and he is not trying to shorten the phrases or sentences. Taseer used good techniques of translation.

Analysis of the translation of Khalid Hassan in the light of Mona Baker's theory

In Khalid Hassan's translation he has translated the cultural words from Urdu to English. He has changed some words from source language (SL) to target language (TL). According to Vinay and Darbelnet (1958) "adaptation is a procedure which can be used whenever the content referred to in the original text does not exist in the culture of the target text, thereby necessitating some form of re-creation. This widely accepted definition views adaptation as a procedure employed to achieve an equivalence of situations wherever cultural mismatches are encountered". For example, he used "sweeping" for "jahroo" (Hassan, 2007, p.45; Manto, 2016, p.64). The cultural word "Marondy" is translated by him as "rice crispies" (Manto, 2016, p.69; Hassan, 2007, p.49). Vermeer (1989, p.222) states that "language is part of a culture". Hassan translated the word "Methyan" as "gifts" (Manto, 2016, p.68; Hassan, 2007, p.48). In Manto's culture it's a trend basically when a person visits someone he/she takes "Methayi" with him/her because it makes the relations strong and also shows care for other persons. It seems that Manto's culture has no importance for Khalid Hassan and he ignored his culture and not translated it in an appropriate manner. According to Jawaharlal Nehru "Culture is widening of the mind and of the spirit". Even he missed some cultural words like "Moulie Saab" and "Double rooti" is omitted by him (Manto, 2016, p.63,65).

Free Translation

The following words are not translated by Khalid Hassan:

In the first paragraph he has not translated the word "Ikhlaqi" (Manto, 2016, p.62).

The sentence "Barhal danish mandoon ky faisly ky mutabik", he has not translated the word "Barhal" (Manto, 2016, p.62). "Free translation is a catch-all category into which everything that is not faithful is dumped, it is almost always vaguely conceived, and always contains vast riches that a hegemonic mainstream tradition has rarely mined or even recalled to mind. Basically, anything that doesn't fit into narrowly defined norms for acceptable translation gets called free translation, even when the so called deviant text is in fact tightly bound to the SL text not at all free" (Baker, 2005, p.88).

The original sentence "Chiniot ky aik mooty Musلمان pagal ny"s is translated as "A Muslim lunatic from Chiniot" (Manto, 2016, p.64; Hassan, 2007, p.46). The word "Mooty" is not translated by him (Manto, 2016, p.64).

The sentence "Jinhon ny mil mila kr Hindustan ky doo tukrye kr diye" is translated as "who had cut India into two" (Manto, 2016, p.65; Hassan, 2007, p.46). The word "tukrye" is missing here (Manto, 2016, p.65).

"aur Fazal Din sy pochha Toba Tek Singh kahan hai" is translated as where is Toba Tek Singh? He asked (Manto, 2016, p.69; Hassan, 2007, p.49). The name "Fazal Din" is missed here. (Manto, 2016, p.69).

Missing Phrases

Following phrases are missed by Khalid Hassan:

The phrase "Baran baras" is not translated by him (Manto, 2016, p.63).

The phrase "aur zyada pagal ho gaye" is not translated by him (Manto, 2016, p.64).

Nida and Taber (1982, p.12) state that "translating consists in reproducing in the receptor language the closest natural

equivalent of the source language message". Translation means to reproduce a message that is closely related to the source language text.

In the next paragraph "tou wo neechy utra" is missing (Manto, 2016, p.64).

"Goo isny wakeel ko thukra diya tha" is not translated by Hassan (Manto, 2016, p.65). The phrase "zehar mar nhe krna parhye gee" is missing here (Manto, 2016, p.65).

In the next paragraph "din ko soota na raat ko" is omitted by him (Manto, 2016, P.66). "Laita be nhe tha" is also excluded by him (Manto, 2016, p.66).

"Freedom, in other words, means deviating from hegemonic norms, breaking the rules, breaking out of the jail of hegemonic tradition. A translation is declared free not (only) when it wanders too far from the meaning of individual SL words or sentences, but when it flouts normative rules set up for the ideological policing of meaning- transfer(Baker, 2005, p.89).

The phrase "jahan ka wo rehny wala hai" is missed (Manto, 2016, p.66). He has not translated "Seeny py hath rakh ky" (Manto, 2016, p.66).

"Acha khata peeta zamindar tha" is missing in Khalid Hassan's translation (Manto, 2016, p.67). The phrase "aur pagal khanye main dakhil krwagy" is missing here (Manto, 2016, p.67).

"yun saajh ban ky milnye waloon ky pass jata" is not translated by him(Manto,2016,p.67). In the next paragraph "wo agr insy pochta" is excluded by him (Manto, 2016, p.68).

He has not translated the phrase "Bishen Singh ny phir pochta" (Manto, 2016, p.69). "Fazal Din ny qadrye hairat sy khaa" is skipped by him (Manto, 2016, p.69).

He has also shorten the phrases like "roo rahy hain bilak rahy hain" and "kaan parhi awaz sunai nhe dati thee" he has translated it just as "In short complete confusion prevailed" (Manto, 2016, p.70; Hassan, 2007, p.50).

Missing Sentences

The following sentences are not translated by Khalid Hassan:

He has not translated the sentence i.e. "jitny Hindu Sikh pagal thy saab ky saab police ki hifazat main border par pohncha diye gy" (Manto, 2016, p.63).

This whole sentence "aur dosrye pagloon sy bilkul alag thalag baag ki aik khaas roash par" is not translated by him (Manto, 2016, p.64). "Another kind of free translation that in fact clings very closely to hegemonic segmental norms is translation that remains faithful to plot segments specific episodes and events in their original sequence, as well as larger segments like exposition, rising action, climax and denouement"(Baker, 2005, p.89).

He has missed the sentence "chonacha us ny aik din apny jungly main ilan kr diya" (Manto, 2016, p.64).

The sentence "tou wakeel ko kaiye pagloon ny smjhaya ky wo dil bura na kare" this whole sentence is excluded by him (Manto, 2016, p.65).

This whole sentence is not translated by him i.e. "Pindalian be phool gaye theen magar is jasmani takleef ky bawajood lait kr aram nhe krta tha" (Manto, 2016, p.66).

This whole sentence is ignored by him"aur iski khair khariat dariafat kr ky chalay jaty thy aik mudata tak ye silsala jari raha" (Manto, 2016, p.67).

"Pr ab jaisye isky dil ki awaz be band ho gaye thee jo isye inki amad ki khabar dai diya krti thee" this complete sentence is excluded by Khalid Hassan (Manto, 2016, p.68).

He also tries to shorten the sentence like "do teen martaba fasad hote hote bacha kyun ky baaz Musلمانoo aur Sikhoon ko ye narye sun ky taish agya tha" he simply translated it as "followed by fights" (Manto, 2016, p.70; Hassan, 2007, p.50).

During translation he has also added some additional sentences or words that are not present in the original text.

Additional Words

The following words are added by khalid Hassan:

"Pakistan aur Hindustan ki hakomatoon ko khayal aya" is translated as "it occurred to the respective governments of India

and Pakistan” (Manto, 2016, p.62; Hassan, 2007, p.44). In this sentence the word “respective” is added by the translator (Hassan, 2007, p.44). Catford(1965, p.25) states that “free translation is always unbounded-equivalences shunt up and down the rank scale, but tend to be at the higher ranks- sometimes between target units than the sentences”.

The word “ustraye” is translated by him as “cut-throat razors” (Manto, 2016, p.63; Hassan, 2007, p.44).He has added the adjective here some of his words are not translated appropriately (Hassan, 2007, p.44).

The sentence “tou Pakistan kahan ha” is translated as “where on earth was Pakistan?” (Manto, 2016, p.64; Hassan, 2007, p.45). He has added the word “on earth” (Hassan, 2007, p.45).

“usny tamam kaprye utar kr dafadar ky hawalye kr diye” is translated as “he took all his clothes off, gave the bundle to one of the bundle to one of the attendants” (Manto, 2016, p.64; Hassan, 2007, p.46). The word “bundle” is added by him (Hassan, 2007, p.46). The word bundle has different meanings in english so, it cannot be associated with clothes. Hatim and Munday (2004, p.34) suggest that “one of the key problems for the analyst was in actually determining whether the source text meaning had been transferred into the target text”. It is important for the translator’s to properly convey the meaning of the source language text into target language text because if the meaning is not clear then it creates difficulty for target audiences.

The sentence “jo Muslim League ka sargram karkoon rah chukka tha” is translated as “who used to be one of the most devoted workers of the All India Muslim League” (Manto, 2016, p.64; Hassan, 2007, p.46). In this sentence the word “All India” is translated by him (Manto, 2016, p.64).

Khalid Hassan used the word “depression” for “dukh” (Hassan, 2007, p.46; Manto, 2016, p.65).The word depression means the condition in which someone feeling very unhappy and he/she has no hope for the future. He has not translated the word properly.

The sentence “Hindustan Pakistan aur pagloon ky tabadly ky mutalik jab kabhe pagal khanye main quftagoo hoti tou wo qoor sy sunta tha” is translated as “recently, he had started to listen carefully to discussions about the forthcoming exchange of Indian and Pakistani lunatics” (Manto, 2016, p.66; Hassan, 2007, p.47). In this sentence “recently” is an additional word (Hassan, 2007, p.47).

“iska naam Bishan Singh tha” is translated as “His real name was Bishen Singh” (Manto, 2016, p.67; Hassan, 2007, p.48). The word “real” is added by him (Hassan, 2007, p.48).

“tou isy apny ap pta chal jata tha” is translated as “he had developed a sixth sense” in this translation the word “sixth sense” is added by Hassan (Manto, 2016, p.67; Hassan,2007, p.48).Manto has not mentioned any type of senses in this story. At some points Hassan has not used the words that are effective and create a better impression for foreign readers.

The sentence “tumhara dost Fazal Din hai” is translated as “this is your old friend Fazal Din” (Manto, 2016, p.69; Hassan, 2007, p.49). The word “old” is additional here (Hassan, 2007, p.49).

“tabadly ki tyarian mukamal ho chuki then” is translated as “meanwhile, the exchange arrangements were rapidly being finalized” (Manto, 2016, p.70; Hassan, 2007,p.50). The word “meanwhile” is added by him (Hassan, 2007, p.50).

“uper di gur gur di anexe di bay dhayana di mung di dal of Toba Tek Singh” is translated as “uper the gur gur the anexe the bay dhayana mung the dal of Toba Tek Singh and Pakistan” (Manto, 2016, p.71; Hassan, 2007,p.50).The word “and Pakistan” is translated by Hassan (Hassan, 2007, p.50).

Additional Phrases

Following phrases are added by Khalid Hassan:

The sentence “Hindustani barye shitani akara kar phirte hain”is translated as “these devils always strut about as if they were the lords of the earth” (Manto, 2016, p.63; Hassan, 2007, p.45). The phrase “as if they were the lords of the earth” is added by him (Hassan, p.45).

“jahroo daity daity aik din darakht par chaar gaya” is translated as while sweeping the floor he dropped everything, climbed the nearest tree” (Manto, 2016, p.64; Hassan, 2007, p.45).The phrase “he dropped everything” is additional here (Hassan, 2007, p.45). “Free translation has been thought of as either bad translation or no translation at all and the less said about it

the better" (Baker, 2005, p.89).

Another sentence from the original text "aik M-S-C pass radion engineer main jo Muslman tha aur dosrye pagloon sy bilkul alag thalag" is translated as "A Muslim radio engineer, who had an M.Sc. degree, and never mixed with anyone" (Manto, 2016, p.64; Hassan, p.46). The phrase "and never mixed with anyone" is additional here (Hassan, 2007, p.46).

The sentence "tou wakeel ko kaiye pagloon ny smjhaya ky wo dil bura na kare" is translated as "his friends offered him congratulations (Manto, 2016, p.65; Hassan, 2007, p.46). This whole phrase is added by Hassan and it is totally different from the original text (Hassan, 2007, p.46). Meetham and Hudson (1972) states "translation is the replacement of a text in one language by a replacement of an equivalent text in a second language". Translation means to replace the source language text into target language text. Translator needs to read the original text properly than he can easily translate it in another language.

The sentence from original text "kya pata ha ky Lahore jo ab Pakistan main ha" is translated as "It was nobody's guess what was going to happen to Lahore, which was currently in Pakistan (Manto, 2016, p.66; Hassan, 2007, p.47). In this sentence "it was nobody's guess" is an additional phrase (Hassan, 2007, p.47).

In the next paragraph the phrase "That was fifteen years ago" is added by him (Hassan, 2007, p.48).

The sentence from original text "is ko ye qatan maloom nhe tha ky din konsa ha" is translated as "he lived in a kind of limbo, having no idea what day of the week it was" (Manto, 2016, p.67; Hassan, 2007, p.48). The phrase "he lived in a kind of limbo" is added by him. This phrase conveys meaning that are not present in original text (Hassan, 2007, p.48).

In the next paragraph the phrase "when he was first confined" is added by Hassan (Hassan, 2007, p.48).

The sentence "Fazal Din raazi khushi ha" is translated as "Fazal Din is well by the grace of God" (Manto, 2016, p.69; Hassan, p.49). In this sentence the phrase "by the grace of God" is additional (Hassan, 2007, p.49).

In the next line the phrase "then he added" is additional (Hassan, 2007, p.49).

The original sentence "Bishen Singh barbarata howa chala gaya" is translated as "without saying another word Bishen Singh walked away murmuring" (Manto, 2016, p.69, Hassan, 2007, p.49). The phrase "without saying another word" is added by him (Hassan, 2007, p.49).

The sentence "tou usny pochha" is translated as "he asked the official behind the desk" (Manto, 2016, p.70; Hassan, 2007, p.50). The phrase "behind the desk" is additional here (Hassan, 2007, p.50).

At some point he tries to shorten the phrases for example "is ki bari khawaish thee ky wo log ayen jo is sy hamdardi ka izhar krty thy" is just translated as "he missed his family" (Manto, 2016, p.68; Hassan, 2007, p.48).

Additional Sentences

The following sentences are added by Khalid Hassan:

The sentence from the original text "Baagh ki aik khaas roash pr sara din khamosh tahla rehta tha ye tabdeeli namodar hoi ky us ny tamam kaprye utar kr" is translated as "he was to taking long walks by himself all day, was so affected by the current debatethat one day he took all his clothes off" (Manto, 2016, p.64; Hassan, 2007, p.46). The sentence "was so affected by the current debates" is added by him (Hassan, 2007, p.46).

The sentence "but the rest of the time, he was always to be found standing" is added by Hassan (Hassan, 2007, p.47). Elmgrab (2014, p.131) argues that "different translation models and approaches have sought to eradicate translational misunderstandings, yet each of them has engendered more controversies than solving existing ones". Different strategies are used for translation. Some strategies are used to solved the problems created during translation and others helped the translators to develop their understanding about translation.

Another sentence "that was fifteen years ago" is additional here (Hassan, 2007, p.48).

In the next paragraph he has added the sentence "when he was first confined" (Hassan, 2007, p.48).

In the second last paragraph of the story the sentence “The night wore on” is added by him (Hassan, 2007, p.51).

Imitation

Hassan imitated the words, phrases and also sentences during the process of translation. Fordonski (2014, p.267) warns:

“Sometimes, however, translators diverged from so defined a path, pushing the boundaries of imitation as far that instead of moving further to emulate (in the sense of outdoing) an admired author they committed forgeries, altering both the contents and form of the original in a way quite contrary to the author’s original intentions”

.The sentence from the original text for example, “Maloom nhe ye bat maqool thee ye qair maqool” is translated as “whether this was a reasonable or an unreasonable idea is difficult to say” (Manto, 2016, p.62; Hassan, 2007, p.44).

The next sentence from the original text “aur bilakhir aik din pagloon ky liye moqarar ho gaya” is translated as “Final details, like the date of actual exchange, were carefully worked out” (Manto, 2016, p.62; Hassan, 2007, p.44).

The original sentence “ye jawab sun kr us ka dost mutamin ho gaya” is translated as “This profound observation was received with visible satisfaction” (Manto, 2016, p.63; Hassan, 2007, p.45).

Sahlin and Wedlin (2008, p.218) argues that “to imitate”, then is not just to copy, but also to change and innovate”. For example the sentence “Hindustani barye shitani akar akar phirte hain” is translated as “These devils always strut about as if they were the lords of the earth” (Manto, 2016, p.63; Hassan, 2007, p.45).

“aur dosrye pagloon sy bilkul alag thalag” is translated as “and, never mixed with anyone” (Manto, 2016, p.64; Hassan, 2007, p.46).

The original sentence “lekin haar mahinye jab isky aziz-o-aqarab is sy milnye ky liye aty thy tou isy apny ap pta chal jata tha” is translated as “however, he had developed a sixth sense about the day of the visit” (Manto, 2016, p.67; Hassan, 2007, p.48).

“is ki aik larki thee jo har mahinye aik ungli barhti barhti pandraa barsoon main jawan ho gaye thee” is translated as “he had left an infant daughter behind, now a pretty young girl of fifteen” (Manto, 2016, p.67; Hassan, 2007, p.48).

Another sentence from the original text “is ki bari khawaish thee ky wo log ayen jo iss sy hamdardi ka izhar karty thy aur is ky liye phaal meethayian aur kaprye laty thy” is translated as “he missed his family, the gifts they used to bring and the concern with which they used to speak to him” (Manto, 2016, p.67; Hassan, 2007, p.48).

“jahan is ki zaminye hain” is translated as “where he used to have his home” (Manto, 2016, p.68; Hassan, 2007, p.48).

The original sentence “aik din tang akar wo is par baras para” is translated as “finally, he told him angrily” (Manto, 2016, p.68; Hassan, 2007, p.49).

“Main boht dinoo sy soch raha tha ky tum sy miloon lekin fursat hi na mili” is translated as “I have been meaning to come for some time to bring you news” (Manto, 2016, p.69; Hassan, 2007, p.49).

From the above discussion it is clear that Khalid Hassan tries to copy the original text but fails to do so because he totally changes the sense of the original text. There is absence of feelings of independence in his translation. He uses those words and sentences that are not considered appropriate. He has not used the strategies of translation in a suitable manner.

Discussion

In this particular study, the translation of “Toba Tek Singh” by Khalid Hassan and Aatish Taseer are analyzed to find out that whose translation is more effective than the other. These two translators used the following strategies like adaptation, free translation and imitation. The strategy of adaptation is more effective than others. Aatish Taseer used the technique of adaptation in a more suitable manner as compared to Khalid Hassan. Aatish Taseer understands the culture of Manto and present it in an effective style.

During the process of translation Aatish Taseer adapted four cultural words. He has not missed the translation of cultural words. He missed the translation of five words. He has also added eight words in translation. Four phrases are additional in his translation. He has also added three sentences during the translation of “Toba Tek Singh”. Taseer has imitated nine

sentences in his translation.

As compared to Taseer, Hassan has adapted three cultural words and the translation of two cultural words are missed by him. Hassan missed the translation of five words and sixteen phrases. He has also missed the translation of eight sentences. In his translation twelve words are additional. He has also added thirteen phrases and five sentences during his translation. Hassan has imitated ten sentences during the translation.

It is clear that Hassan has totally changed the sense of the original text. He has ignored precision, exaggerated a lot and there is absence of feelings and emotions in his translation. He has not used the effective strategies of translation. He is not capable to keep the meaning constant. Taseer has maintained the beauty of the original text as compared to Hassan. He has a good technique of translation. Translation has some gaps but in Aatish Taseer's translation less gaps are seen as compared to Khalid Hassan.

Conclusion

This study concludes that translation is very important because due to translation the culture and language of one person or society is transferred to another person or society. There are some shortcomings in every translation such as omission and addition of words and phrases. Sometimes, there are misinterpretations too. Translation can be much better if target language is the native language of the translator.

Aatish Taseer's translation of "Toba Tek Singh" is more appropriate than Khalid Hassan. There is a coherence in his translation. In Khalid Hassan's translation there are a lot of flaws. He has distorted the original sense during translation. He has no effective techniques of translation. Hassan has tried to copy the words exactly which does not seem an original text but a copy of text. It seems that Aatish Taseer has a good technique of translation. He in some sense seems to be the author of the text due to his contextual coherence. He is culturally familiar with the writer of the text so his translation is considered as the best and appropriate translation.

Recommendations

The translation of Manto's other stories like "Buu" and "Thanda Gosht" can also be explored with same research technique for broadening the knowledge of the readers. The translation of cultural words and idioms can also be done with the help of Mona Baker's book "In Other Words"

Translation plays an important role in everyday life. Due to translation the knowledge of one person is transferred to another person. People can understand the culture and language of another society. Translation improves our everyday communication. It's a great opportunity for foreign readers because of translation they can easily understand different languages and also communicate in an easy way.

About the Author

Saddiqa Ahsan is currently a student of B.ed at Allama Iqbal Open University Islamabad. She is also working as a faculty member at Allied School Bahawalpur. She has done BS Hons in English from Government Sadiq College Women University Bahawalpur. She likes travelling, reading and watching documentary movies.

References

- [1] Abbasi, G., Zadeh, S.S., Janfaza, E., Assemi, A., & Dehgan, S.S. (2012). Language, translation and culture. *International conference on language, medias and culture*. Retrieved from www.ipedar.com.
- [2] Abrar, A. (2015). Transparency or transfer? The case of Manto's Toba Tek Singh. *The context*. Retrieved from <http://www.magnuspublishing.com>.
- [3] Amjad, F. (2013). Problems and strategies in English translation of Quranic Divine name. *International journal of linguistics*. Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.5296/ijl.v5i1.3301>
- [4] Anonymous. (1998). Toba Tek Singh (trans.). Retrieved from c:\Documents and settings\Polo\Meus documentos\Toba Tek Singh-2mht
- [5] Arfanti, Y. The equivalence and the shift of meaning in the translation of Indonesian into English in the cover stories of Tempo Magazines. Retrieved from <http://www.citeseerx.ist.psu.edu>
- [6] Baker, M. (2005). *Routledge encyclopedia of translation studies*. London & New York.
- [7] Baker, M. (1992). *In other words. A coursebook on translation*. London:Routledge.
- [8] Catford, J.C. (1965). *A linguistic theory of translation*, London, Oxford University press.
- [9] CUI, S. (2016). Research on tourism English translation based on cultural difference. *International Conference on Economics and Business Management*. Retrieved from <http://www.dpi-proceedings.com>

- [10] Elmgrab, R. (2015). Authenticity and imitation in translating exposition: A corpus- based study. *Journal of Educational Issues*. Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.5296/jei.v1i1.7781>
- [11] Ghanooni, A. (2012). A review of the history of translation studies. *Theory and practice in language studies*. Retrieved from <https://www.semanticscholar.org>
- [12] Guo-rong, S. (2010). Corpus-based approaches to translation studies. *Cross-cultural communication*. Retrieved from www.cscanada.net
- [13] Holmes, J.S. (1972). The name and nature of translation studies. Unpublished manuscript. Amsterdam: Translation Studies Section, Department of General Studies.
- [14] Holmes, J. (2000). The name and nature of translation studies. In L. Venuti (Ed.), *The Translation Studies Reader*. London and New York: Routledge
- [15] Jixing, L. (2012). Changes of translation definition and turns of translation studies. *Cross-Cultural Communication*. Retrieved from <http://www.cscanada.org>
- [16] Kaur, N. (2015). Toba Tek Singh in English: An assessment of Khalid Hassan translation. *International Journal of English Research*. Retrieved from www.englishjournals.com
- [17] Khan, M. (2014). The comparative study of various translations of Manto's short story Toba Tek Singh. *International Journal of Research*. Retrieved from <https://journals.pen2print.org>
- [18] Malik, A. (2016). *Manto ke afsane*. Faiz ul Islam printers (pp. 62-71). Retrieved from Rmail House of Publications.
- [19] Manto, S.H. (2009). Toba Tek Singh: *Manto selected stories* (Taseer. A, trans.) (pp.1-10). Random House Publications.
- [20] Manto, S.H. (2007). Toba Tek Singh: *Manto selected stories* (Hassan. K, trans.) (pp. 44-51) Newyork.
- [21] Naqvi, T. (2007). Toba Tek Singh (trans.). *Manoa*
- [22] Nida, E. and Taber, C.R. (1969). *The theory and practice of translation*. Leiden: E.J. Brill.
- [23] Niroula, P. (2017). Translation techniques used in translating cultural words of PALPASA CAFE. Retrieved from <http://hdl.handle.net/123456789/831>
- [24] Ordudari, M. (2007). Translation procedures, strategies and methods. *Translation Journal*. Retrieved from <https://translationjournal.net>
- [25] Pardo, B. (2013). Translation studies: An introduction to the history and development of audiovisual translation. *LINGUAX*. Retrieved from <https://www.uax.es/publication/translation-studies-an-introduction-to-the-history-and-development-of-pdf>
- [26] Pym, A. (1998). *Method in translation history*. Manchester: St Jerome
- [27] Panou, D. (2013). Equivalence in translation theories: A critical evaluation. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*. Retrieved from www.academypublication.com
- [28] Pritchitt, F. W. Toba Tek Singh (trans.). Retrieved from C:\Documents and Setting\Polo\Meus documentos\toba-tek singh-3.mht.
- [29] Sawant, D, G. (2012). A research proposal on the problem of equivalence in translation. *Conference Paper*. Retrieved from <https://www.researchgate.net>
- [30] Safi, A.B. As. Translation theories, strategies and basic theoretical issues. Retrieved from <https://translationjournal.net>
- [31] Shuttleworth, M. and Cowie, M. (1997, 2004). Dictionary of translation studies. Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing/ Shangai: Shangai Foreign Language Education Press.
- [32] Vanilla. (2010). *Kinds of translation*. Retrieved from <http://transvanilla.blogspot.com.br/2010/04/kinds-of-translation.html>.
- [33] Wulandari, Y,A,D. (2016). Techniques for translating cultural words in English to Indonesian subtitles of Frozen. *DIGILIB UNNES*. Retrieved from <https://lib.unnes.ac.id>
- [34] Zou, S. (2016). Research on the cultural equivalence in translation. *International Conference on Management, Education, information and control*. Retrieved from <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org>